THE ARYAN PATH

Canst thou destroy divine Compassion? Compassion is no attribute. It is the Law of Laws—eternal Harmony, Alaya's Self; a shoreless universal essence, the light of everlasting right, and fitness of all things, the law of Love eternal. The more thou dost become at one with it, thy being melted in its Being, the more thy soul unites with that which Is, the more thou wilt become Compassion Absolute. Such is the Arya Path, Path of the Buddhas of perfection.

—*The Voice of the Silence*

VOLUME XXVII
January-December 1956

THE ARYAN PATH OFFICE
"Aryasangha," Malabar Hill
BOMBAY 6

INDEX

General Index

* Review-articles. The books upon which they are based are listed in the usual alphabetical order in the Index of Book Reviews.

Index of Book Reviews

Index of Correspondence

Index of Notes

Index of "Ends and Sayings" Paragraphs

Index of Names and Pseudonyms of Writers of Articles, Reviews, Notes and Correspondence

THE ARYAN PATH

Point out the "Way" — however dimly, and lost among the host — as does the evening star to those who tread their path in darkness.
—The Voice of the Silence

VOL. XXVII JANUARY 1956 No. 1

"THUS HAVE I HEARD"—

Blessed are they which are persecuted for righteousness' sake: for their's is the kingdom of heaven.

—THE SERMON ON THE MOUNT

The eighth anniversary of the passing away of Gandhiji, on 30th January, should be an occasion for heart-searching by all those who profess to be his followers. The best way of remembering the Father of the Nation is to reflect upon his martyrdom, to learn by heart its great lessons and to consider afresh what should be done to atone correctly for his sacrifice, so that the blood of this martyred saint might water the Garden of Peace and Unity in the India he loved.

Not only in the political sense is Gandhiji the Father of the Nation. His greatness is not to be measured by the fact that he freed India from foreign bondage; or even by his endeavours and achievements which gave a deathblow to social and religious evils. His greatness is enshrined in his devotion to and growth toward Truth and in the inspiration of his example. It is in his Religion of Life, his moral philosophy, his dynamic programme of *Satyagraha,* which he did not only preach but actually embodied. Very striking indeed are his own earnestness and sincerity in practising in day-to-day living the eternal principles he enunciated. He showed the grand triumph of the Human Soul. Is Gandhiji's moral philosophy something original and unique? His humility unfolded an insight and he declared:—

I have nothing new to teach the world. Truth and Non-Violence are as old as the hills. All I have done is to try experiments in both on as vast a scale as I could.

My strength lies in my asking people to do nothing that I have not tried repeatedly in my own life.

It is significant that he called his autobiography *The Story of My Experiments with Truth.* They alone do really follow him who are daring enough to experiment with Truth in all walks of life and to follow

wherever Truth may lead them. Many have given lip acceptance to Gandhiji's ideas and teachings, but few have made a deliberate attempt to apply them in their personal lives or in public service. Why is it so? Because the knowledge which brings enlightenment and conviction is not pursued. The most pressing need of India, as of the world, is a careful study of the potent ideas of the Gandhian psycho-philosophy. How can Gandhiji's principles be applied in individual or national life if they are not studied and understood? It is through self-discipline of the whole man that true knowledge of moral verities can be absorbed by the mind. Such knowledge is an effective purifier. Even the Buddhas can but point the way which man himself has to walk.

Since Gandhiji's death much has been done to popularize the Gandhian teachings. His written and spoken words have been collected, collated and commented upon; but unless these are "learnt by heart," digested by the mind and assimilated by the consciousness, practical application is impossible. Many of his pregnant and potent pronouncements, the Soul side of *Satyagraha*, are not generally quoted even by his avowed followers. Why? Are such not quite palatable even to them? Or is their true worth not comprehended?

Can India make history by creating the Gandhian Era, when Russia and China and the U.S.A. and so many other countries are manufacturing the Era of the Atomic Bomb? This work is for the sincere individual and to him these words of Gandhiji are sure to bring inspiration:—

My uniform experience has convinced me, that there is no other God than Truth...the only means for the realization of Truth is Ahimsa....To see the universal and all-pervading Spirit of Truth face to face one must be able to love the meanest of creation as oneself.

Identification with everything that lives is impossible without self-purification; without self-purification the observance of the law of Ahimsa must remain an empty dream; God can never be realized by one who is not pure of heart. Self-purification therefore must mean purification in all the walks of life. And purification being highly infectious, purification of oneself necessarily leads to the purification of one's surroundings.

But the path of self-purification is hard and steep. To attain to perfect purity one has to become absolutely passion-free in thought, speech and action; to rise above the opposing currents of love and hatred, attachment and repulsion. I know, that I have not in me as yet that triple purity, in spite of constant ceaseless striving for it. That is why the world's praise fails to move me, indeed it very often stings me. To conquer the subtle passions seems to me to be harder far than the physical conquest of the world by the force of arms.

SHRAVAKA

GANDHI AND THE MODERN WORLD

[**Ethel Mannin's** sympathies with India's culture are well known, and these are not only the reflexes of those of her husband, Reginald Reynolds, famous in India as a devotee of Gandhiji. Her article is apposite for this month's ARYAN PATH, for it was in January 1948 that Gandhiji entered the small band of heroes who are true martyrs. Her true remarks about the young people "of Bombay, Calcutta and Rangoon" and their "shoddy notions and false values" are a timely warning, which, let us hope, will enable at least a few of these "progressive" youths to reform themselves.—ED.]

When I was in India in 1949 I was constantly meeting educated young Indians who assured me that what they called "Gandhi-ism" was dead, that it died with Gandhiji, and was anyhow impractical in the modern world. They prided themselves on having liberated themselves from Hindu orthodoxy, and "Progress" now was all their cry; that is to say, industrialization, chemical fertilizers, tractors—those "iron bullocks" so eminently unsuited to Indian agriculture. It was saddening; but even more saddening when two young men from the Hindu University at Benares said bitterly that "Gandhi-ism" was already dead when Gandhiji was assassinated.

On the face of it, in view of the bloodshed which followed the partition of India, it would appear to be true. Just as it would appear to be true that Christianity died with the crucifixion of Jesus, when all the violence and power-lust and greed indulged in by *soi-disant* Christian peoples in the subsequent two thousand years is considered. There is a sense in which "Gandhi-ism" is a misnomer, since the doctrine of non-violent resistance to evil and of personal purity of flesh and spirit was the teaching of Jesus two thousand years earlier; the Buddha, six hundred years before that, taught reverence for life in all its forms, human and animal alike, but not the specific doctrine of *satyagraha*; but the term is valid in that Gandhiji was of our time and brought to our world a moral force such as the world had never known (Jesus in his time did not so kindle the imagination of millions), and as a moral force Christianity has ever been pitilessly punctured by expediency.

It is true that India, since independence, can no more be called a "Gandhi-ist" country than England, or any other Western country, can be called Christian—whatever the professions, as devout as they are hypocritical, of Christianity. Had India deeply absorbed and accepted the teachings of the Mahatma it would have been unthinkable that his assassins should have been executed. It was of this the two young men of the Hindu University

were thinking when they made their bitter assertion. For them the Mahatma's memory, and his doctrines with it, had been rejected by the masses, dissolved in the dust of cremation, the greatest moral force of human history become an "eagle forgotten." From that angle Vachel Lindsay's poem would seem singularly appropriate applied to this twentieth-century saint :—

> Now you were ended. They praised you,
> ...and laid you away.
> The others that mourned you in silence
> and terror and truth....
> That should have remembered forever,
> ...remember no more.

There is a sense in which Gandhi has become a name—who once was a living spiritual flame.

There is also a sense in which that flame still lives in men's hearts, not only in India, but the world over, and will continue to live until the planet is entirely given over to the powers of darkness, which it cannot be until that living flame is finally quenched. Which means that it may never be.

We have seen in connection with the Goa demonstrations that the spirit of *satyagraha* still lives in India; we have seen that spirit kindled also in the recent demonstrations in South Africa, in which Gandhi's son, Manilal, played a leading part. Now, it seems, ironically, that a peaceful invasion of Kashmir is being planned by Pakistani *satyagrahis* (organized by the Christian Zamindara Labour League of Lahore), ten thousand of whom plan to march peacefully into Indian-held territory on September 15th.[1] Whatever views one may hold on the political rights and wrongs of the long-drawn-out "Kashmir question," it is anyhow a sign of grace that ten thousand who believe that Kashmir should go to Pakistan are willing to demonstrate their belief in a non-violent fashion. Gandhi's spirit still lives, even with those who denounced him in his lifetime.

And it will continue to live, because the alternative is the extinction of the human race. The scientists have warned the world that recourse to atomic weapons, to total war, that is to say, can only mean total annihilation. This means that in the modern world there must be total renunciation of war—for they deceive themselves who aver that atomic weapons would not be used, that the atomic bomb, in its ever-increasing hideousness, is a power for peace. Whatever country henceforth resorts to the arbitrament of war lets loose total destruction upon the entire planet; in a radio-active world life cannot be sustained in any form, and those who survive death by burning or blast can only do so to die of starvation. Mankind is already gradually destroying the earth's fertility by chemicals and machines, creating dust bowls and soil erosion, adding man-made desert to desert. This destruction of

[1] This article was written before September 15th.

fertility can be halted and remedied; there can be no halting of an atomic war or any remedying of its consequences. The idea that science will somehow throw up something effective in the way of defence in an atomic war is the sheerest wishful thinking—there can be no defence in total war, as the scientists have warned us, from Einstein downwards.

But war in any shape or form is an abomination, a crime against life to which those who venerate life, as Christ and the Buddha and Gandhi venerated it, cannot in any circumstances lend themselves. It is a sad comment on human nature that many who denounce the latest atomic bomb are nevertheless quite prepared to accept a non-atomic war—in spite of the napalm horrors of the Korean war. *The hope for humanity lies in the growing number of people, the world over, who are gradually coming to accept the principles of non-violent resistance to evil, as taught and demonstrated by Gandhi in our own time.*

It has tremendous, and heartening, significance that many leaders of the African nationalist struggle against imperialism have been influenced by Gandhi and have urged *satyagraha* methods upon their followers. This was observable in 1953, in East Africa and down to Cape Town, and many Africans in Northern Rhodesia were to be seen wearing "Gandhi buttons"—badges with the profile of the Mahatma engraved on them. This is all the more interesting when it is remembered that Gandhi's career began in South Africa. If the teachings of the Mahatma are largely rejected in his own country, by a generation which has grown up in the violence of the newly launched atomic era, among the less sophisticated and less Westernized peoples of Africa, the country in which he began, his spirit is still active.

In India itself the success of the land-distribution campaign conducted by that remarkable old man, Vinoba Bhave, points to a revival of the Gandhian spirit. Vinoba has followed directly in Gandhiji's footsteps by going into the villages, without any fanfare of preliminary publicity, with nothing "organized," relying entirely, as Gandhi did, on the moral force of his appeal to what the Quakers call "that of God in every man." Such an appeal, however, would be made in vain without the driving power of love behind it. Gandhi declared, "The hardest fibre must melt in the fire of love"; he demonstrated the fact over and over again in his own life, and now Vinoba Bhave is similarly demonstrating it. When the fire is not strong enough there is no response. In Gandhi's case it was strong enough to make him so profound a moral force that this "half-naked fakir," as Churchill scornfully called him, could pit himself effectively against the great weight of the political power of the

British Raj. The possessionless, thin little man in the loin cloth had to be cajoled and conciliated, because by love alone he had a nation of some four hundred millions behind him. When the people, lacking his moral strength, resorted to violence on occasion he grieved and prayed and fasted. *He would have no more to do with the unorganized violence of the masses than with the organized violence of governments. He declared that he would prefer to be crushed between the two.*

It is a tragic pity that the Arabs of North Africa should have resorted to violence in their struggle against the French. When it comes to that sort of thing the French are vastly better equipped and organized, as has been demonstrated. Impassioned, unorganized mobs have no chance against disciplined, impersonal troops. All that happens as a result of these outbreaks is that blood is shed, men die or go to prison, and "law and order" is restored more repressively than before. The need was, as Gandhi pointed out during the Civil Disobedience campaign in India, not to be goaded into either violence or abject submission. He believed in the power of suffering as he believed in the power of love. He was an idealist, but a practical one. The angry Arabs of the Maghrib are idealists too, but not, unfortunately, practical ones. They may yet need to come to an appreciation of Gandhi's methods before they achieve their nationalist ends. Certainly these are not to be achieved by outbreaks of violence.

Reginald Reynolds, in his book, *To Live in Mankind : A Quest for Gandhi*,[2] writing of Basic Education, which teaches people how to live co-operatively as opposed to Westernized education which merely provides a smattering of Western culture and is bound up with the acquisition of degrees, declares that "India's ultimate problem will not be the untouchables but the unteachables." It could be said with equal truth that *the whole world's ultimate problem is the unteachability of the mass-produced mentality, for which the press, cinema and radio are largely and jointly responsible.*

The real hope for the salvaging of civilization would appear to be in the East. Not merely is the bulk of the world's population in its "teeming millions," but that bulk is ninety per cent agrarian and as such not corrupted by the lies and false values of what passes for civilization in the West. The young people—especially—of Bombay, Calcutta and Rangoon are perhaps as much bound and delivered over to shoddy notions and false values (usually in the name of "Progress") as their counterparts in the West; an insidious Americanization, the Coca-Cola civilization, has invaded urban life in both East and West, from Morocco to Mandalay, from

[2] André Deutsch, 1951.

Rome to Rangoon, but it does not penetrate to the hidden villages of the Rif, the off-the-road villages across the Burmese paddy fields, the jungle villages in the middle of the vast subcontinent of India. There still remain vast areas of human existence outside the Coca-Cola belt. Throughout India, Burma and China, there are far-reaching basic educational schemes which, whilst they include literacy, place it lower on the agenda than the teaching, by example, of co-operation in communal living.

Such schemes are in the direct Gandhian spirit, which, along with non-violent resistance of evil, reverence for all life, devotion to truth and righteousness, demands an all-embracing love and co-operativeness in our relations with our fellow humans.

In the West experiments in co-operative living are conducted through the medium of "work-camps," where men and women of good will, young and middle-aged alike, meet to work for the common good: in building a youth hostel or a community centre, for example. Here again the Gandhian spirit of service operates. It might be that because the West has reached a crisis in its civilization it may yet prove fertile soil for Gandhian ideas, even if it does not recognize them as such. It may well be, as Reginald Reynolds suggests in his book, that Gandhi "will share the fate of so many other prophets, whose ultimate effect has been most deeply felt outside their own countries."

The extent to which Gandhi's ideas will endure and develop in the modern world is debatable. What there is no disputing is the world's urgent need of them, as the only guarantee of its continued existence.

ETHEL MANNIN

TIRUPATI ORIENTAL INSTITUTE

At the present time, when the prevailing tendency is towards industrial development and, consequently, technological studies, the establishing of Oriental Institutes like the one at Tirupati should be helpful in developing the cultural aspect of the life of the people.

The varied plans of this Institution are all for the single purpose of making available to the present generation the profound ideation of the ancients on a variety of subjects, ranging from literature, culture, sociology and philosophy to the medical sciences and engineering. This is proposed to be achieved by the publication of rare texts and by the translation of such authoritative works into English. A laudable venture indeed!

More Institutions of this nature are needed in this country for the propagation and regeneration of ancient culture, so that the heritage of the past is not lost to the present. India appears to be submerging fast in the materialistic trends of modernism and thereby losing its hold on that fundamental basis of thought which has been at the root of all her cultural development.

THE PALACE AND THE PLANT

[Our esteemed friend **Mikhail Naimy** has presented our readers with this beautiful story with a message of supreme importance to the modern world. What can we do with our atom-bomb factories? The story brings the right answer. It has, however, a deeper implication. The Great Buddha's Noble Eightfold Path has as one of its steps the determination of the right means of livelihood. The choice of the profession and employment by which we earn bread to live has a mystical implication; does our daily work spread, unbeknown to us, love or hatred, balm or poison? Does it stand for service or loot?—ED.]

On the banks of a broad, deep river, dotted with tall smoke-stacks, stands an ammunition plant with a rich past of over a century behind it, and a fame extending to all the corners of the globe wherever War is not yet infamous. Opposite the plant, on the other bank, rises a green hill, and on the top of the hill a palace which is the envy of all palaces.

The plant and the palace were tied to each other as are a father and a child; for the plant begot the palace and never ceased to tend it with infinite care and affection. While the palace, as behooves a dutiful child, never tired of catering to the slightest whims of its parent—the plant.

Until recent years the palace was the Mecca of the *elite*, whether of wealth, of refinement or of social prestige. They came in great numbers from far and near, and always found a warm reception and a diversity of entertainments and occupations to suit the taste, the vocations and the hobbies of each. The cuisine and the cellar were the choicest. The shelves of the spacious library were weighted with exquisitely bound volumes of all descriptions. On the walls of the art gallery hung the rarest gems of the great masters. In the stables were horses of the finest breeds; in the kennels, dogs of the noblest pedigree; in the birdhouses, winged creatures of the loveliest plumage and the sweetest vocal chords. Hidden here and there in the beautiful forest surrounding the palace were spacious swimming pools, magnificent aquaria, rustic kiosks and nooks for solitary meditation or impassioned *tête-à-tête*, as well as meticulously kept playgrounds for various recreations. In the river below were maintained yachts, launches, rowing boats and canoes for the lovers of aquatic sports. Needless to say, the furniture, the tapestry, the *bric-à-brac* and the art objects in the palace were of the rarest and most expensive varieties.

That was the state of the palace until three years past. Since then its gay and lavish life has undergone a most drastic change. The stables and the kennels are now entirely empty. There is not a feather or a twitter in the birdhouse, not the

splash of a fin in the fish ponds. The playgrounds are overgrown with weeds, and at the wharf in the river below there is but one small motorboat. Inside the palace not a string vibrates with music, not a voice is raised in song, not a peal of laughter is heard anywhere. The gaiety of yore has flown out of the palace since the day its masters flew in a plane to their death, leaving the plant and the palace to their only son and sole heir who had hardly completed his twenty-third year.

The heir made a quick disposal of all the signs and manifestations of lavish, high living, keeping to himself a modest car to drive him down the hill to the wharf and back and a motorboat to carry him to and from the plant on the opposite bank. Both the car and the boat he drove himself.

As to the plant, the young heir increased its output tenfold within the three years of his management, and added about two thousand to the list of its employees. Those who knew him marvelled without end at his sagacity and business acumen in managing the huge plant during the most trying years of the second world war, despite his tender age, his lack of experience and, above all, a decided "twist" in his character and manners. Not only did he seal the lips of the palace, put blinds on its eyes and clip its wings; he also stripped it of the finest and costliest objects for which it was famous and discharged all its servants save one whose name was Samson, to whom he was attached to the point of calling him "Father," and of not allowing him to address him except as "Sonny."

Samson was a man of seventy, yet quite robust and vigorous, very simple of mind and most pious of soul. He had the heart of a babe and the conscience of an angel. When still a child in an orphanage, he was taken into the household by the young heir's grandfather. His deep attachment to his young master began when the latter was still in the cradle. It grew with the years into something akin to adoration, a circumstance which at times frightened Samson, who had heard it said that it was a sin to worship two gods.

Although it puzzled Samson to see his young master turn the life of the palace upside down, it did not grieve him half as much as to observe the disquieting change in his appearance. The young man seemed to grow thinner from day to day and to have surrendered to a deep, dumb melancholy whose signs were readily discernible in his eyes and about the corners of his mouth. Samson could not find the courage in his heart to broach the subject to his master; and the young fellow, contrary to his habit of sharing all his cares and troubles with his trusty servant, would not of himself divulge the secret. What added to Samson's anxiety and perplexity was the fact that on a certain evening, as his master was withdrawing into his

bedchamber, he turned to him with supplicating eyes and said in a low, disheartened voice, "Samson, Father Samson! I have grown so fat that I am about to burst."

Believing that the young man was jesting, Samson remarked, affecting a smile, "God be blessed, Sonny. You *have* grown so fat that I, an old man, could blow you off your feet! Are you ill, my boy?"

"I am, Samson."

"What ails you, my child?"

"Mine is a most deadly illness. It is the illness of those who are in perfect health, yet are *not well*."

"Perhaps you have suffered a great loss in your business, my son."

"On the contrary, Samson. I have *suffered* tremendous profits."

"Why, then, are you melting away and melting me with you?"

"I wish I knew why."

"Is it the war that's eating the flesh off your bones, chasing sleep from your eyes and peace from your soul?"

"Pray for me, Father Samson. Pray for me."

The aged servant was stricken dumb by the tenor of his master's equivocal speech. Yet, driving all dark thoughts away, he went into his room, knelt piously by his bed and prayed long with all his heart and mind that God might reveal to him the cause of his master's melancholy and progressive emaciation.

And Samson slept the sleep of the blessed. Just before dawn he heard a voice calling him and saying: "Take a pen and paper, Samson, and write."

Obeying the command as one who had neither mind nor will of his own, Samson took a pen and a sheet of paper and began to write what the voice dictated to him. And this was what he wrote:—

Woe to you who drive the caravans of Death, for you shall knock in vain at the caravansaries of Life.

Woe to you who suck the breasts of grief-stricken mothers, for you shall grow fat with grief.

Woe to you who steal the sleep of the sorrowing, for you shall woo sleep in vain.

Woe to you who eat the crumb of the hungry, for you shall never be filled.

Woe to you whose only stock in trade is poison, for poison shall be your gain.

Woe to you who hide behind the veil of Night, for the Morn shall expose your wretchedness.

Woe to you who bathe in the holy blood of men, for you shall rot away in your unholiness.

The voice stopped. Samson started as one stung and was amazed beyond measure to find himself holding a sheet of paper and to see that what was written on it was written in his own hand. For a moment the thought struck him that he too, like his master, had lost his mental balance. He could hardly wait for the young man to call him. As soon as he heard his voice he rushed into

his room, told him of his strange experience in an agitated voice and said, as he handed him the paper in his hand, "I have prayed, my son, prayed very hard. Perhaps this is the answer to my prayer. But I confess I can't make anything of it."

The young man took the paper from his servant and, as he read it, his face turned ashen, and a great shiver shook him from head to foot, causing the paper to drop from his hand to the ground. As Samson bent to pick it up, his master took him by the shoulder, shook him violently and, staring at him with flaming eyes, shouted in rage, "Samson, Samson ! Who taught you the art of imposture ? "

Poor Samson was dumbfounded at his master's behaviour and tone. His throat became suddenly dry and tight, and his eyes misty, and his head began to swim. Limp and almost lifeless, he dropped to the floor with a thud. Seeing him in that state, the young man became frightened and very conscience-stricken. He bent over the aged servant, began to rub and kiss his hands and to call to him tenderly and lovingly.

"I have sinned against you, Samson. Forgive me. Up, up, Father Samson. Now I understand. I understand everything."

And he kept rubbing Samson's hands and feet and showering him with words of affection until the old man came to. Not a word of plaint or reproach escaped his lips, but softly and quietly he withdrew from the room to go and prepare his master's bath before attending to his breakfast, as was his wont every morning. Hardly had he gone into the kitchen when he heard his master call him from the bath-room. There was distress in that call. Straightway he hurried to the bathroom, only to be trans-fixed in the doorway as his eyes fell upon the young man standing en-tirely naked, with his whole body from neck to toes soaked in what looked like blood. Even the water in the tub had the colour of blood. The sight filled the poor servant with terror and made his stout heart sink and almost stop beating. His first impression was that the young man had slashed his throat in an attempt to put an end to his life. Fortunately for Samson his master quickly dissipated his fears when he turned to him with loving eyes and asked him in a most tender voice in which there was not the slightest trace of anguish or reproach, "Why is this water so red ? "

" It was crystal-clear, my son, when I filled the tub," replied the old man sheepishly.

" It was clear also when I got into it. Whence is this bloody colour ? "

Samson bent immediately over the tub, emptied it, rubbed it carefully and turned on the water. It was as clear and pure as an infant's eye. Whereupon he went back to the kitchen to attend to breakfast, his simple mind very

much puzzled and his loving heart still beating loud and fast. Before two minutes had passed he was called again to the bathroom. The same scene; the same story: the water had turned blood-red the moment the young man sank into it. After the third vain attempt the despairing heir decided to do without his morning bath. On leaving for the plant without taking a mouthful of the food his servant had prepared for him, he had only this to say to Samson: "I have found out the reason, Father Samson. I have found it."

The whole day Samson's mind was very much distracted and his heart faint. He could hardly wait to see his master again in the evening; perhaps he would lift the curtain off this mystery and the many other mysteries with which he felt himself surrounded of late. But his master delayed coming much beyond his usual hour, which delaying was a fresh source of worry for the poor old man.

It was almost midnight when the young ammunition manufacturer came back and found Samson awaiting him at the end of the road, from where he had a clear view of the plant. The night was soft and warm, with the waning moon riding the clear, eastern sky and casting a mantle of magic over the darkened palace and the dreaming woods all about. The young master greeted his servant with a broad smile dripping affection, peace and joy and, taking him by the hand, he led him to a nearby bench and invited him to sit down with him and to enjoy together the charming stillness of that moonlit night. For a while the two sat silent side by side with the young man's arm about Samson's neck and his head against his shoulder. Finally the young man broke the silence and said, "Look at me, Father Samson. Have I not gained weight since this morning?"

"You do look much better, my son. You are not the same man that left this hill in the morning."

"The best medicine in the world is to find the cause of illness and eradicate it. With your help I discovered the cause of my many troubles. Congratulate me, Samson."

"Thank the Lord, my son."

"Samson, Father Samson! If you make a dagger and sell it to me knowing that I intend to kill a man with it, and if I do kill the man with that dagger, wouldn't you be my accomplice in the murder?"

"Without the slightest doubt, my son."

"Then I was right in what I did."

"What did you do, my son? Do you mean that you have killed somebody?"

At that very moment a terrific, deafening blast shook the palace and the bench on which the two were sitting. The awful rattling of the doors and window shutters, the sound of splintered glass, the

sudden swish throughout the forest, the frightful agitation in the air—all this was sufficient to strike panic into poor Samson's heart, giving him the impression that the whole earth was quaking and was about to swallow him and his beloved master alive. His first thought, however, was not of his own safety; it was to shield his master with his own body as if to protect him from the fury of the earth. Quickly it became apparent to him that something worse than an earthquake was taking place. The opposite bank was billowing with fire and smoke, with loud detonations following one another in rapid succession. It was quite evident that the plant was burning. The sight of it so horrified the faithful servant that he lost control of his nerves and wits. All he could think of doing was to fall down on his knees and to mumble incoherently, his hands beating his chest hard and loud.

"O Lord my God! The plant . . . What a calamity! What a loss! Lord, Lord, stop it—stop the fire. Let us go from here. Let us seek shelter from the bursting shells. The plant, my son. The plant."

The young man bent over his trusty servant, embraced him with both arms, quieted his shattered nerves and said to him very tenderly and reassuringly, "Is it honest and manly of us, Father Samson, to cook for others food which *we know* to be poison?"

"Certainly not, my boy," came the old man's quick and positive answer.

"Did you not write with your own hand that he whose only stock in trade is poison shall gain nothing but poison? How shall I expect to sell to others poison and to get honey in return? The poison is now spilled. What a delightful, what a profitable loss!"

Saying that, the young man dashed towards the palace and pasted on its main entrance the sheet of paper which Samson had handed him in the morning. Then he strode back to his servant, took him gently by the hand and led him down the hill to the wharf, where both stepped into the motorboat and drove upstream. Without casting even a passing glance backward, the young man lifted his eyes to the skies and exclaimed reverentially, "Accept, Lord, my sacrifice."

The morning dawned upon the ruins of the plant, still licked by tongues of flame here and there, and upon a boat gliding smoothly and steadily towards a far land, accessible to none but wanderers.

MIKHAIL NAIMY

"JUS GENTIUM" AND THE LAW OF NATURE IN ASIA

[**Professor Charles H. Alexandrowicz-Alexander** is rendering great service to the cause of internationalism by his scholarly work as the Professor of International Law in the University of Madras. He delivered an excellent lecture on "International Law and Relations" at the Indian Institute of Culture, Bangalore, in August 1952. In the following informative article he writes about a subject of great importance to the future of mankind.—ED.]

The two most significant developments of contemporary international law are its universal extension to all nations capable of independent political organization and its endeavour to enforce the prohibition of aggressive wars. The principle of universality of the "family of nations" and the doctrine of "just war" were already an integral part of the classic law of nations (*jus gentium*), conceived on the basis of the law of nature, but at the end of the eighteenth century they were lost in the process of the law's conversion into a positivist system, based only on the consent of states and state practice.

The conception of the law of nature found its way into the Greek system of inter-city relations; it existed also in ancient Rome and was later developed by the Roman Catholic Church in its framework of canon law. The mediæval structure of Europe was based on the existence of the two correlated centres of power: the Holy Roman Empire, which represented secular authority and the Church of Rome, which was the repository of ecclesiastical jurisdiction. Under this system of unified power there was at first little room for the development of the law of nations. The gradual emergence of autonomous political units, however, such as the Italian city-states and the kingdoms of England and France, promoted treaty-making and an increasing number of inter-state relations. As the Holy Roman Empire approached its period of disintegration, particularly after the Peace Treaty of Westphalia in 1648, there was more opportunity for the growth of the law of nations as a separate discipline.[1]

Similar developments took place at various periods in the history of Asia. China early developed her own notions of inter-state law and practice with a strong emphasis on the institution of vassal states who acknowledged the supreme authority of the imperial suzerain. There seems to have been legal equality among these mutually independent states in the Chinese Commonwealth. Diplomatic intercourse was well

[1] *A Concise History of the Law of Nations*, by A. NUSSBAUM, 1950.

known and envoys enjoyed immunity though to a lesser degree than in the West. The distinction between combatants and non-combatants during warfare came to be acknowledged and humanitarian principles were observed to a substantial degree. Confucius planned the establishment of a great union of Chinese States, but imperial power prevailed over this conception. The same institutions developed in Japan where, according to historians, treaty-making was known as early as in the third century A.D.

India's contribution to the development of the law of nations in Asia was equally remarkable. As a unified imperial power appeared only at intervals and for comparatively short periods in the history of the subcontinent, the relations between the many Indian rulers resulted in the development of principles of an international or quasi-international character. Kautilya's *Arthashastra* bears witness to the existence of a well-defined set of rules which prevailed in the various "circles" of states. Interstate law in India knew humanitarian rules of warfare, the inviolability of envoys (*dutas*), the vassal-suzerain relationship and principles relating to maritime intercourse.[2]

It is also noteworthy that since the Middle Ages the treatment of foreign merchants became the object of treaty stipulations. In Asia, as in Europe, foreign trading communities fought for the relaxation of the practice of seizure of ships and the confiscation of the property of deceased foreigners by the local sovereign (*jus albinagii*). The law of nations developed by Muslim states witnessed even speedier development resulting from the close contacts of the Islamic powers with Europe. The fight between Islam and the Christian world created a centuries-long tension, the consequences of which were strongly felt in India and Asia since the end of the fifteenth century.

There is no risk in saying that the conception of natural law was not alien to these systems of interstate law in Asia. It may be that canon law in Europe helped to make it more precise there because it distinguished clearly between positive divine law (*jus divinum positivum*), *i.e.*, revealed law; the law of nature (*jus divinum naturale*), *i.e.*, law based on reason and human nature; and, finally, man-made law (*jus humanum*). These three categories of law were known in Asia, though the more intimate interconnection between natural law and revealed law made a clear distinction between the two more difficult and perhaps sometimes impossible. But this is a problem of philosophy rather than one of jurisprudence. The fact remains that the notion of natural law existed in Asia, that it conceived human nature in its ideal

[2] *International Law in Ancient India*, by S. V. VISWANATHA, 1925.

and moral sense, as in Europe, and that it was ready to be extended to the whole of mankind. It was based on the broad principle of non-discrimination between nations and implied generally the idea of just war. The idea of a law of nature in the sense of self-preservation, strongly emphasized by Emeric de Vattel, the Swiss jurist and writer, in the eighteenth century, found its early expression also in Kautilya's *Arthashastra*, though not necessarily as an overriding device (see Book VII).

It is often thought that no law of nations had been applied to inter-continental intercourse between European and Asian powers during the period of political equality between them in the sixteenth, seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. This, however, is hardly warranted by facts.[3] Among the European powers who entered the Asian game of power politics, the Portuguese were first; then came the Dutch, the English and the French. Vasco da Gama, who landed in 1498 on the west coast of India, brought a queer mixture of notions to the Asian scene. He came to discover and occupy new lands, to buy spices, to undercut the trade of the Arab merchants and Venice, and last but not least to make converts to Christianity. He felt legally entitled to act on the commands of his king, who believed he had been authorized in 1502 by Pope Alexander VI to start conquests in non-Christian lands. The world had been, according to the papal bull, "*Inter Caetera*" of 1492, divided between the two great sea powers, Spain and Portugal, one with the mission to sail westwards, the other eastwards. The line of demarcation, drawn in the bull, was later adjusted in the treaty of Tordesillas of 1494, concluded between Spain and Portugal.

As soon as Spanish rule in America made itself brutally felt on the ruins of the Aztec and Inca empires, a powerful reaction appeared among Roman Catholic writers in Spain who endeavoured to clarify the prevailing confusion of ideas. Conquest, they said, was a political affair, a matter of *jus humanum*. Conversion, on the other hand, was a matter of *jus divinum*, but it should not disturb the peaceful existence of organized political communities in non-Christian lands. So argued Franciscus de Vitoria (1480-1546), Professor at the University of Salamanca, Spain, and his school, and it goes to the credit of Spain that he was allowed to attack the policy of his own king and country. But Vasco da Gama, like Cortez, was no follower of Vitoria but an empire builder and so were the Portuguese viceroys who followed him and who seized Goa. The prestige of international lawyers (theologians) was not yet powerful enough to influence decisively

[3] *Asia and Western Dominance*, by K. M. Panikker, 1954.

public opinion and political decision.

The Portuguese who, thanks to the support of the Raja of Cochin and the Vijayanagar rulers, were able to destroy the maritime trade monopoly of Arab merchants in India and Asia and to shatter the sea power of the Zamorin of Calicut, had soon to face the competition of the Dutch who brought, apart from naval power and a trading spirit, an aggressive challenge to the legal notions of the Catholic monarchs. The Dutch were Protestants and so was their greatest lawyer, Hugo Grotius, usually considered the father of the law of nations. The construction put by the Catholic sea powers on the papal title of discovery and the conversion of non-Christian lands became a matter of doubt. Historians often tend to identify papal policy with the policy of Catholic monarchs, though what the Church of Rome conceived as a religious device was often distorted by secular authority for purposes of power politics. The responsibility for excessive zeal rested with the monarchs, who, whenever it suited them, became, "*plus Pape que le Pape*" (more popish than the Pope). Be that as it may, the prestige of Grotius overshadowed world opinion from the beginning of the seventeenth century. In his *Mare Liberum* (Freedom of the Seas), published in 1609, he made it clear that the Portuguese in India and Asia established relations and made arrangements with Asian rulers on a footing of equality and that any other European power could do the same. Whatever Grotius intended primarily to show by his arguments, particularly to prove the right of the Dutch to sail freely across the oceans and to participate in Asian trade, he gave at the same time to Asian rulers the status of sovereigns in his law of nations. He could not have done otherwise, as his legal notions were based on a system of natural law which implied the equality of organized political communities all over the world. Otherwise the law of nature could not have been what it was meant to be. Moreover, Grotius relied in *Mare Liberum* on all the arguments of Franciscus de Vitoria and proved that the conceptions of the Protestant and the Salamanca schools of the law of nations were not divergent in the above field.

Whereas the Dutch arrived in the East to challenge Portuguese vested interests by physical force, the English came with a policy of negotiation. In 1615 Sir Thomas Roe, an English ambassador, set foot on Indian soil and travelled from Surat to Agra to present letters from King James to Jehangir, the Moghul Emperor. His task was to open negotiations and to obtain a treaty securing trading rights to English merchants.[4] Seventeen years earlier, one of the greatest

[4] *The Men who Ruled India : The Founders*, Vol. I, by PHILIP WOODRUFF, 1953.

international lawyers of all times, Alberico Gentili (1552–1608), an Italian Protestant who had become a professor of law at Oxford, had published his famous works on the law of war. Gentili's law of nations based on the law of nature was universal law relating to the whole of mankind and he could not have given any sovereign ruler in Asia a position inferior to that of sovereign monarchs in Europe. The embassy of Sir Thomas Roe fully testifies to the English notions of the law of nations at this period. They were not different from those formulated later by Grotius and the motive behind them was certainly more selfless.

A battle of wits took place at the court in Agra, where Sir Thomas Roe had to face the Portuguese Jesuit mission which had come much earlier from Goa.[5] The Moghul court became clouded with intrigues, but it would be an over-simplification to blame one or the other side for excessive zeal. Diplomatists tend to criticize on the part of their adversaries what they consider justified in the implementation of their own mission. In spite of English-Portuguese tension, Father Corsi, S.J., offered to Sir Thomas Roe to mediate between the English and the Portuguese, so as not to expose Christian agencies in India to the disgrace of disunity. Sir Thomas Roe was certainly the last to betray his Christian ideals. But, whereas he and those who came after him from England enjoyed the unfailing support of their king, the King of Portugal undercut, about the middle of the eighteenth century, the existence of the Jesuit mission at the Moghul court by banishing all Jesuits from Portuguese dominions. The provincial centre of the *Societas Jesu* in Goa disappeared (1759) and their greatest scholar, Father Joseph Tieffenthaler, appealed to the English for protection.

It seems fair to assume that a three-cornered game of power politics between the Moghuls, the English and the Portuguese, without Dutch and French intervention, would probably have been distinguished by less violence and by more compromise and treaty-making. The fact that Dutch intervention came in the seventeenth century intensified the fight against the Portuguese in Asia and made Grotius formulate his case on behalf of the Dutch East India Company in a truly dramatic way. Side by side with the Dutch, the rulers of Asia became the *dramatis personæ*. Their policy was not to limit intercourse and trade to the Portuguese but to establish relations with other European powers. In order to enable them to pursue this policy, Grotius endowed them in *Mare Liberum* with full independence and sovereign status in a *chef-d'œuvre* of the classic law of nations.[6]

[5] *The Jesuits and the Great Mogul*, by Sir Edward Maclagan, 1932.

[6] "Grotius and India," by C. H. Alexandrowicz-Alexander. (*The Indian Year Book of International Affairs*, Vol. III, 1954).

After the death of Aurangzeb the disintegration of the Moghul Empire together with the ascendency of the English East India Company put things in a different light. The unifying power of the Moghuls had disappeared and neither the Marathas nor any of the other Indian or European powers were able to restore the balance. A similar development had taken place in Europe where, after the Treaty of Westphalia in 1648, the unifying power of the Holy Roman Empire had ceased to be effective and where the balance was temporarily at the mercy of ruthless power politics. The disappearance of the two most powerful empires of the world had a decisive impact on the law of nations. The ideal of the law of nature with its underlying conceptions gave way to the law of survival from which a positivist system of international law emerged. At the time of the Congress of Vienna in 1815 the family of nations was restricted to those represented at the Conference table. The Asian powers, paradoxically including even Turkey, did not find their proper place under the new system. Whereas it proved ultimately possible to establish in place of the Holy Roman Empire a more or less predictable balance of power which resulted in the creation of the Concert of Europe with its own public law, there was no Concert of rulers in India to supersede the Moghul Empire. International law conceived as the public law of Europe excluded the whole world (except the American continent) and covered Asia in the status of colonial possessions only. The Chinese Empire, whose future, in spite of isolation, was doomed after the downfall of the Moghuls, was equally outside the family of nations which followed for nearly 150 years the positivist conception of international law. Today international lawyers have started revising the notions of international law and a revival of certain ideas of the law of nature seems to be in sight. Two of its most fundamental conceptions have again found their proper place: the universality of the "family of nations" which covers all continents, and the concept of "just war" by which we endeavour to ban aggressive war from the international scene.

CHARLES H. ALEXANDROWICZ-ALEXANDER

GITA GOVINDA

A LITERARY GEM AND A BOOK OF DEVOTION

[**Sahityalankara Kavibhushana Shri K. S. Nagarajan, B.Sc.,** is a well-known Sanskrit scholar, a devotee of the Beautiful and a lover of Dharma, of his religion, Hinduism, which has to offer us not only grand philosophies but also great literature which has inspired many through the ages and continues to do so. Shri Nagarajan is a notable example. The subject of his article is one such literary gem.

The love of Krishna and Radha has been grossly misunderstood; it is an allegory of the human soul yearning with knowledge for union—yoga—with the Eternal Spirit. The poet's use of erotic endearments is but a device; many a mystic and devotee, especially of the Sufi school, has used it to bring to the ordinary reader some intimation of the stirring feeling of the devotee, comparable in profane experience only to the deep love of man and maid.—ED.]

The *Gita Govinda* of Sri Jayadeva is an immortal work, which has enchanted the souls of hundreds of devotees and delighted the hearts of thousands of scholars in India, both by its literary elegance and by its melodious music. It is a devotional lyric of exceptionally rare merits, which stands unique and supreme in Sanskrit literature. In literary grandeur and beauty it is a gem, to be compared only to the *Meghaduta* of Kalidasa and perhaps excelling it too. No reader but has admired and adored its rare charms, none but is carried aloft to reeling altitudes of exultation.

As in the case of the other great poets of India, very little is known about Jayadeva's parentage and birthplace. From the lyric itself we gather that he was the son of Bhoja Deva and Rama Devi (or, perhaps, Radha Devi), the friend of Parashara and a man of lovable personality and rare gifts:—

श्रीभोजदेवप्रभवस्य रामा(राधा ?)देवीसुत-
श्रीजयदेवकस्य ।
पराशरादिप्रियवर्गकण्ठे श्रीगीतगोविन्दकवित्वमस्तु ॥
[*G.G.*, 12–11]

May the composition, *Sri Gita Govinda*, of Sri Jayadeva, son of Rama Devi and Sri Bhoja Deva, flourish well in the voices of Parashara and other good friends.

The name of his wife was Padmavati. He has mentioned the names of Umapatidhara, Sharana, Acharya Govardhana and Kaviraja, who were, along with Jayadeva, according to the findings of Shri Sanatana Goswami, the poetic gems that adorned the royal court of King Lakshmanasena, the son of Ballalasena of Bengal. In fact the following verse was engraved on a stone in front of the King's Assembly Hall:—

गोवर्धनश्च शरणो जयदेव उमापतिः ।
कविराजश्च रत्नानि समितौ लक्ष्मणस्य च ॥

Govardhana, Sharana, Jayadeva, Umapati and Kaviraja were the jewels in the royal court of King Lakshmana.

Since Lakshmanasena ruled Bengal during the eleventh century, it may be inferred, without straying far from the truth, that Sri Jayadeva must have flourished about that time. From the following verse in Canto III of the *Gita Govinda* it would appear that he was "the moon of the ocean of Kindubilwa," who composed songs on the Lord Hari:—

वर्णितं जयदेवकेन हरेरिदं प्रवणेन।
किन्दुबिल्वसमुद्रसंभवरोहिणीरमणेन॥ [3-10]

This song of Hari is described by Sri Jayadeva, who is the moon rising from the ocean of Kindubilwa, and skilled in such compositions.

The *Bhaktimahatmya* of Chandradatta devotes three cantos to the biography of Jayadeva, the devotee of Lord Jagannatha of Puri, and states that he was born in a village named Bindubilwa in Orissa, in a poor Brahmin family, and was a worshipper of the Lord from his childhood.

The following is a brief account, as furnished therein, of his early life and the circumstances in which he wrote his lyric. In the same village lived another Brahmin, Devasharma, who was for a long time childless. He vowed to Jagannatha (the Lord of the World) that, if he was blessed with children, he would give away the first-born to Him. Soon he was blessed with a galaxy of good children. True to his word, he brought his first-born, who was a lovely daughter, named Padmavati, to the temple as soon as she was eight years old (then the prescribed marriageable age for girls) and offered her at His feet. The Lord commanded in his and the temple priest's dreams that she be given in marriage to Jayadeva, one of his best devotees. Though Jayadeva initially protested, on the grounds of his own poverty and ineligibility, he finally accepted her, after testing her devotion and fidelity and tasting for the first time the grace of feminine association. She dedicated herself to the service of the Lord, at the feet of her husband, in a lifelong companionship.

After this happy marriage, Jayadeva once determined to sing the glory of the Lord and began to compose the *Gita Govinda*. While he was composing "*Rasacharitam,*" a portion of his composition, the following verse flowed from his pen spontaneously :—

स्मरगरलखण्डनं मम शिरसि मण्डनं
देहि पदपल्लवमुदारम्। [10-7]

Dear Radha, please place your soft and lovely foot, which pacifies the poison of passion, as an ornament on my head.

Jayadeva thought that this was a serious error in his composition and wanted suitably to alter it. Thinking of the possibilities of a proper replacement, he went to bathe, scoring out what he had written. In the meantime, the Lord seems to

have visited his house in the guise of the poet himself, taken the book from his wife and, having restored the lines, gone away before the poet returned from his bath. On his return Jayadeva was surprised to find the original lines restored. He learnt that night, in a dream, that none other than the Lord himself had intervened in his composition and sanctioned the retention of what he had thought was impious. He was only sorry that he had not been as fortunate as his wife in having welcomed the Lord in person.

There are a few other episodes which prove beyond doubt that the *Gita Govinda* is a book full of deep devotion to the Lord. The King himself composed a *Gita Govinda* and commanded that it alone should be sung. Jayadeva continued to sing his own composition before the Lord. Asked by the King why he disobeyed his command, he seems to have answered that the Lord was not as pleased with the King's composition as with his. The King, though enraged at this bold answer, agreed to put it to the test. Both books were placed at the feet of Lord Jagannatha in the temple at Puri at night, and the next morning it was found that the Lord approved Jayadeva's composition. The King had no alternative but to submit to the behests of the Lord.

Once, when a vegetable hawker was plucking brinjals, singing *Gita Govinda*, the Lord seems to have followed her, throughout the night, attracted by the beauty and melody of the songs. The next day the priest of the temple was distressed to find bleeding wounds on the body of the Lord, which, he came to know later on, were made by thorns which pierced him while passing through the brinjal plants.

It is also narrated that Padmavati, who fell lifeless at hearing false news of her husband's death, was brought back to life the moment Jayadeva returned and began to sing the songs from his *Gita Govinda*, as if to keep him company in his devotions as was her daily wont.

Thus the lyric was very popular and delighted devotees and scholars alike during the lifetime of the poet, who is supposed to have performed miracles also. Even now, it is believed, Lord Jagannatha will be present wherever the *Gita Govinda* is sung perfectly to the correct music. A popular saying is even now current to the effect that it is impossible to find a pious man like Jayadeva:—

जयदेवसमः साधुर्नभूतो न भविष्यति

A man pious as Jayadeva never was in the past and never will be in the future.

Besides, the author of the *Gita Govinda* seems to have written no other work than this. There are two more Jayadevas in Sanskrit literature: one is Jayadeva, son of Mahadeva and Sumitra and author of the famous *Prasanna Raghava*, a

drama of great merit and popularity, and the other is the author of *Sringara Madhaviya*, a *Champu*. Neither of these could be identified with Jayadeva, the author of the *Gita Govinda*, for obvious reasons.

उन्मीलन्मधुगन्धलुब्धमधुपव्याधूतचूताङ्कुर-
क्रीडत्कोकिलकाकलीकलरवैरुद्गीर्णकर्णज्वराः ।
नीयन्ते पथिकैः कथं कथमपि ध्यानावधानक्षण-
प्राप्तप्राणसमासमागमरसोल्लासैरमी वासराः ॥

These days, in which the fever of the ears is removed by the sweet, melodious songs of playful cuckoos in the freshly blossomed mango sprays which are shaken by bees greedy for the fragrance of honey, are somehow being spent by travellers who are in a rapturous state due to the thought of their union with their beloveds just for a moment.

This verse, occurring in the third part of the first canto of the *Gita Govinda*, is quoted by Kaviraja Vishwanatha, the author of *Sahitya Darpana* (a Bengali who lived in the fourteenth century) as an instance of *Vrittyanuprasa*, a *shabdalamkara* (figure of speech) akin to alliteration and assonance. This is an instance to indicate the great esteem in which the *Gita Govinda* was held by critics and pundits. There are several commentaries on this immortal work, of which the *Rasamanjari* of Mahamahopadhyaya Shankara Misra and the *Rasikapriya* of Kumbha Bhoopala are very popular.

The composition consists of twelve cantos of charming verses. Their recitation produces an extraordinary exhilaration, known only to those who have experienced it again and again. Critics of many different schools of thought have showered their encomia upon the unique merits of this rare and gifted composition of Jayadeva :—

महाकविश्रीजयदेवविरचितं श्रीगीतगोविन्दकाव्यं
मृदुलपदसरणिललितं रुचिरार्थसंहतिबहुलं
सरसरागनिबद्धसुप्रबन्धप्रधानं शृङ्गाररसभाण्डार-
सदृशं ...

Beautiful with strings of words running on liquid sounds, weighty with significance, melodious with a variety of *ragas* and *talas* in music, overflowing with erotic sentiment, the poem *Gita Govinda*, composed by the great poet Jayadeva, entices one and all.

When one begins to love the poem one never ceases to love it. It is the case with all things beautiful—"A thing of beauty is a joy for ever."

क्षणे क्षणे यन्नवतामुपैति तदेव रूपं रमणीयतायाः

That which gains freshness every second is a truly beautiful thing.

The language employed is chaste, smooth, spontaneous. The flow of words never tires us.

The scene is laid on the sacred banks of the Yamuna river in Brindavan. The various moods of the Lord in the company of scores of cowherd maidens, chief of whom is Radha, are described with a rare insight into human nature and a rarer depth of devotion, which captivate our hearts. It is undoubtedly here that the yearning, hungry and thirsty soul is "enraptured, feasted,

fed." This is what Jayadeva himself says at the commencement of his composition :—

यदि हरिस्मरणे सरसं मनो यदि विलासकलासु कुतूहलम्।
मधुरकोमलकान्तपदावलीं शृणु तदा जयदेवसरस्वतीम्॥

If the mind is inclined to meditate on the Lord, if it is eager to indulge in music and sport, listen to the composition of Jayadeva, which is full of sweet and soft strings of beautiful words.

In the first *ashtapadi* (the name of a stanza form) he describes the *Matsyavatara* (Fish Incarnation):—

प्रलयपयोधिजले धृतवानसि वेदम्
विहितवहित्रचरित्रमखेदम्।
केशव धृतमीनशरीर जय जगदीश हरे॥
[1-1-1]

O Lord! Hari, bearing the body of a fish, you have without effort saved the four Vedas submerged in the waters of the ocean,

and continues to describe all the ten incarnations of Vishnu.

The most popular of these verses is one in which the friend of Radha advises her not to tarry in following the Lord, who is the master of her mind, lovely as Eros himself, and waiting for her on the banks of the Yamuna :—

रतिसुखसारे गतमभिसारे मदनमनोहरवेषम्।
न कुरु नितम्बिनि गमनविलम्बनमनुसर तं हृदयेशम्॥
धीरसमीरे यमुनातीरे वसति वने वनमाली।
गोपीपीनपयोधरमर्दनचञ्चलकरयुगशाली॥
[5-11-1]

Lord Krishna, whose hands are wavering by their contact with the full bosoms of the maidens, is waiting on the banks of the Yamuna, where the wind is blowing gently, for a conjugal and blissful union with you. Go and join him quickly.

The female companion of Radha approaches Krishna and gives an account of Radha's condition during her separation from the Lord :—

पश्यति दिशि दिशि रहसि भवन्तम्
तदधरमधुरमधूनि पिबन्तम्।
नाथ हरे सीदति राधा वासगृहे॥ [6-12-1]

श्लिष्यति चुम्बति जलधरकल्पम्।
हरिरुपगत इति तिमिरमनल्पम्॥ [6-12-6]

Radha looks for Him in all quarters and embraces the dense darkness which is like a cloud, thinking that the Lord has come.

Also very graphic and picturesque is the description of the condition of Krishna expecting the arrival of his beloved Radha :—

पतति पतत्रे विचलति पत्रे शङ्कितभवदुपयानम्।
रचयति शयनं सचकितनयनं पश्यति तव पन्थानम्॥ [5-11-3]

नामसमेतं कृतसङ्केतं वादयते मृदु वेणुम्।
बहु मनुतेऽतनु ते तनुसङ्गतपवनचलितमपि रेणुम्॥
[5-11-2]

He looks at her path after preparing the couch even when a leaf falls or a wing flutters; he gently plays on the flute with the name engraved on it and values even a dust particle which has had contact with her body.

There is a passionate human appeal running throughout the

composition. It abounds in grand descriptions of natural scenes. There is a harmonious blending of the description of Mother Nature and that of human nature. The poem has a great lesson for us. Supreme bliss is easily realized by deep devotion to and sincere adoration of the Lord. It is easier for women to accomplish this. By her constant thoughts Radha was able to bear any amount of trouble and separation. Through this she was able to identify herself with the Lord.

Thus the *Gita Govinda* is a delightful account of the amorous associations of Radha and Krishna. The life of Radha is, in its entirety, dedicated to the service of the Lord even as that of a staunch devotee. Her devotion is so deep, so sincere and so pure that she is unable to bear even a moment's separation from Him. She does not tolerate other maidens loving her Lord and does not want to see Him in their company. At last by her sincerity and purity she succeeds in snatching Him from the others to her side. She does not rest until this is accomplished. The Lord, who yields himself to the force of devotion and dedication, is gently dragged to her side and is ultimately seen begging Radha to place her feet on his head.

Radha may be stated to represent a sincere and hard-working disciple in his efforts to attain the Supreme Bliss of Brahman. The poem is, in effect, a harmonious combination of devotional song and excellent literary composition which delights devotees and scholars alike at all times and in all places.

K. S. NAGARAJAN

B.C.G. VACCINATION

In his revised edition of *B.C.G. Vaccination: Why I Oppose It*, Shri C. Rajagopalachari collects world-wide statistics and authoritative quotations, which he wisely evaluates and comments upon. After reading this material from many countries, health authorities, medical men and medical journals it would seem almost impossible not to agree with his conclusions:—

> Where there is substantial doubt among scientific men there should be no compulsory or officially sponsored mass vaccination.... My own conviction is that this B.C.G. injected in the body does nothing to improve resistance to human tuberculosis and that we should work for immunization...by the improvement of conditions and ways of living and not through vaccination.

Dr. Jacob Pomerantz, a tuberculosis specialist of Philadelphia, U.S.A., recently in India, on November 5th wrote a letter to the Secretary, Council of Public Affairs, Madras, which is here quoted with the Doctor's permission:—

> It goes without saying that my feelings about B.C.G. are that it is a waste of time, money and effort.

"The opinion of world medical men on the whole," concludes Rajaji, "tends to prove the undesirability of launching this mass B.C.G. campaign"; and he adds that nothing "ought to stand in the way of the withdrawal at any stage of this ill-advised programme."

E.P.T.

GIFT WAVES

[This interesting article is by **Mr. B. T. W. Stevenson**, M.A., F.L.A., the Chief Librarian of Atkinson General Library, Southport, England.—Ed.]

If one sits quietly and tries to make the mind a complete blank—to think of nothing at all—one becomes aware of a continuous succession of images and ideas, often seeming quite capricious and unrelated, arising for no obvious reason. Apparently this phenomenon is not confined to our waking hours alone, for, according to J. W. Dunne, the author of that remarkable book, *An Experiment with Time*, this succession of ideas goes on just as continuously even when we are asleep, although we do not often remember what we have experienced in our dreams, or even realize that we have dreamed at all. To quote from Dunne:—

> Many people, I knew, were genuinely convinced that they never dreamed; but, from experiments I had made, I was satisfied that "dreamless sleep" is an illusion of memory. What happens is that one forgets the dreams at the instant of waking.

Whence does this involuntary stream of ideas come? Obviously many of our thoughts and dreams are based on memories of past experience; some, obviously, have a physical origin, while others, according to Dunne, are connected with future events. There are yet others which seem to fall into none of these categories—impulses of good and evil, intuitions of various kinds, especially those which come in response to problems connected with our life or work. The scientist or research worker suddenly receives a flash of unexpected knowledge which illuminates the problem on which he has been engaged, perhaps throwing open the way to some great new discovery. In the same way an artist, musician or poet divines new forms of beauty, new expressions of the age in which he lives. To the religious man come new aspirations, new ideas for the liberation of mankind. How is one to account for these sudden "brain waves" as they are so aptly called? The popular expression gives its own clue and suggests some form of mental radio which enables receptive minds to pick up ideas which are "in the air" as we say. If there is anything in telepathy—and in the light of the recent experiments of Dr. Soal and others we cannot reasonably doubt it—then, every human being is a kind of receiving set, bombarded continually by a multiplicity of thought waves. As the wireless receiving set can be attuned to different wave lengths, so the human mind can attune itself to thoughts and images of many different kinds, for in the world of thought like attracts like.

But man, besides being a receiving set, is also a transmitter of ideas.

What we think is important not only to ourselves but also to our fellow beings, who may be influenced by our thought. This imposes a fearful responsibility on every one of us; for, if our noble thoughts and aspirations can influence other human beings for good, it seems just as certain that evil thoughts can further debase those whose minds are already attuned to evil. If this is so, it clearly behooves us to see that our minds are continually filled with positive and constructive thoughts, thoughts of benevolence and good will, optimistic thoughts, and conversely that we immediately banish from our minds any tendency towards negative and destructive thinking.

To return for a moment to the analogy with the wireless receiving set, we know that it is not only affected by the radiations emitted by terrestrial transmitters, but that it also receives radiations from cosmic space, emitted by radio-active bodies like the sun and from other sources. This suggests that similarly mental radio may not be solely confined to the emanations from the minds of our fellow men, but that messages may also be received from beings on other planes than our own. In a work entitled *The Nirvanic Path: The Yoga of the Great Symbol,* which is included in a collection of translations of Tibetan texts edited by W. Y. Evans-Wentz and published under the title *Tibetan Yoga and Secret Doctrines,* there is a passage which seems to support this idea. The neophyte in the study of *yoga* is instructed thus:—

> Then, having prayed for the boon-conferring "gift-waves," absorb them into thyself. Think that thy mind is blended with the Divine Mind [of the *Gurus*]. And remain in that state of [mental] at-one-ment as long as possible.

In a footnote the editor explains:—

> The "gift-waves" are waves of psychic energy, which stimulate spiritual development and greatly assist the aspirant seeking *Nirvanic* Enlightenment, the highest boon of the *yogic* practices of the Great Symbol. These "gift-waves" are sent forth telepathically from the *Gurus*, some of whom exist on Earth, others in the superhuman realms. It is the granting of these "gift-waves," otherwise known as the "conferring of power" which constitutes the true spiritual initiation.

The religious recluse who seeks the seclusion of a monastic cell, a desert or a mountain cave, like the great Tibetan saint Milarepa, has always been an enigma to the worldly man who sees value only in personal contact with other human beings. Such a man usually has a sneaking respect for the person who devotes himself to social work in a slum, but the life of the hermit is something beyond his comprehension. It seems to him to be a waste of time, a shirking of responsibility, and nothing more. But is it not conceivable that a saintly recluse, by acting as a transmitter of lofty thoughts and ideals, may perhaps be fulfilling a far more important and

effective role than he could ever exercise as a preacher or missionary in the ordinary sense of the word?

The idea of the radiation of good will is a familiar feature in Eastern religions and nowhere is it more in evidence than in Buddhism, which is commonly thought of as a somewhat cold and inhuman creed. The "Metta Sutta" counsels the disciple to meditate in this way:—

May all beings be happy and at their ease: may they be joyous and live in safety!...Let none deceive another, or despise any being in any state; let none by anger or ill-will wish harm to another! Even as a mother watches over and protects her child, her only child, so with a boundless mind should one cherish all living beings, radiating friendliness over the entire world, above, below and all around without limit.

The "Maha-Sudassana Sutta" describes a similar exercise:—

And he lets his mind pervade one quarter of the world with thoughts of Love, with thoughts of Equanimity; and so the second quarter, and so the third, and so the fourth. And thus the whole wide world, above, below, around and everywhere does he continue to pervade with heart of Love, Compassion, Joy and Equanimity, far-reaching, great, beyond measure, free from the least trace of anger or ill-will.

One of the aims of all esoteric religion is to make the disciple sensitive to these higher influences which, although they come to all human beings alike, are rarely noticed or heeded. Our minds are too often attuned to the grosser and slower life-vibrations of strife, ambition, rivalry and the various insistent demands of the many-sided human personality. Until we learn to shut out the confused clamour of these conflicting voices, how can we hope to hear the "still, small voice" which sounds in vain for so many of us? We must learn to make the receiving set of the mind far more selective if we are ever to distinguish these higher wave-lengths.

How this state is to be achieved is clearly beyond the scope of this article, but a valuable hint may be found in the following passage from Jacob Boehme's dialogue, *Of the Supersensual Life*:—

When thou standest still from thinking of Self and the willing of Self. When both thy intellect and will are quiet, and passive to the expressions of the Eternal Word and Spirit; and when thy soul is winged up, and above that which is temporal, the outward senses and the imagination being locked up by holy abstraction, then the Eternal Hearing, Seeing and Speaking will be revealed in thee, and so God heareth and seeth through thee, being now the organ of *his* Spirit, and so God speaketh in *thee*, and whispereth to thy Spirit, and thy Spirit heareth his voice.

TREVOR STEVENSON

NEW BOOKS AND OLD

"SEARCH FOR PURPOSE"*

In Dr. Arthur E. Morgan's new book, *Search for Purpose*, we have a passionless and lucid account of the results of a lifetime's tireless endeavour to define a satisfying aim in life that might bring out the best in himself and best contribute to the success of the human adventure. Born in 1878, Arthur Morgan wished even as a boy to "get general direction, purpose and motivation" for his life. Without the advantages of a university education or any formal technical schooling or apprenticeship, and although hampered by poor health, he slowly worked his way from the bottom to a good engineering practice. In time he acquired a great reputation as an engineer and planned and directed as many as seventy-five water-control projects, served as Chief Engineer of the Miami Conservancy District and actively collaborated in the drafting of state draining codes.

In 1920 he became President of Antioch College, Ohio, and, during the decade and a half when he administered its affairs, he instituted an educational plan of alternate study and work which has certain features in common with Mahatma Gandhi's scheme of education through a basic craft. Dr. Morgan felt that mere intellectual training led to a lop-sided development of college students' faculties, and by stressing work as well as study he wished to save them from what C. Rajagopalachariar has called the "stupidities of the middle class," which is fast becoming allergic to manual work.

Meantime, in 1933, Dr. Morgan was appointed the first Chairman of the Tennessee Valley Authority. His admirers and detractors were alike agreed that Dr. Morgan was endowed with a keen and original mind, and that he was a great engineer and a great organizer with a marvellous capacity for leadership; Miss Dorothy Thompson referred to him in an article as "a distinguished public servant, a man of unselfish service, unchallenged personal integrity, and complete incorruptibility"; but it was also clear, in Mr. Herman Pritchett's words, that "he was a serious and somewhat diffident person, often appearing ill at ease in social relationships, with little lightness or humour apparent in his make-up." Once he took a decision, he was "strong-willed, earnest and determined, convinced that there was a moral basis in his judgments."

In more recent years Dr. Morgan has been actively engaged in authorship and, since 1941, in directing, as its President, the activities of Community Service, Inc. His memoirs on the life and work of Edward Bellamy, author of the Utopian fantasy, *Looking Backward: 2000-1887*, were followed by an illuminating study of Utopias, *Nowhere was Somewhere*, in which Dr. Morgan sought to prove that the visions and dreams of Utopian writers like More and Bellamy were not so fanciful as they appeared, but had a solid basis in their knowledge of the Inca civilization of ancient Peru. During 1948-9, Dr. Morgan toured India as a member of the Indian University Commission, and it is generally known that he was mainly responsible for the chapter on Rural Universities in its Report. He felt attracted to Gandhian ideas. As at

* *Search for Purpose.* By ARTHUR E. MORGAN. (The Antioch Press, Yellow Springs, Ohio, U.S.A. 197 pp. 1955. $3.00)

Antioch, Dr. Morgan would like the Indian rural university to fuse properly formal education and work experience so that it might "help to build a bridge between the world of scholarship and the life of the common people." Engineer and educationist, an idealist who is also a hard-headed realist, tardy in forming conclusions, yet tenacious in holding them, gentle and mild but capable of defiant courage and dogged resistance, endowed with both a restless social conscience and a Puritan dislike of the showy, the fraudulent and the frivolous, Dr. Morgan is without question one of the most remarkable men of twentieth-century America. There is something of Benjamin Franklin and of our own engineering wizard, Visvesvarayya, in Dr. Morgan, something too of the relentless social purpose of Albert Schweitzer, and, again, something of the earnestness, fearlessness and ethical fervour of Gandhiji. If, on the other hand, Dr. Morgan cannot quite be ranked with a Schweitzer or a Gandhi, the reason is, as he himself acknowledges, "my own mediocre and limited personality in motive, intelligence, energy, vitality, education and judgment," although it must be said that there is an element of greatness in this very admission of lack of greatness.

In this "spiritual autobiography" Dr. Morgan's aim is to indicate how, through a process of trial and error, intellectual inquiry and everyday experience, he unwearyingly sought for—and found—a way of life. Men influenced him not a little but books even more, for the library was to Dr. Morgan "a whole congregation of friends." He was attracted to the "spiritual bodies" of compact human aggregates and also to the values of man's cultural inheritance; yet, always, he was anxious to maintain "full freedom of inquiry": how to eat this cake and still have it was the "continuing problem"! Dr. Morgan saw that in the saga of evolution the biological world, while sporting with life, is unable to dispense with matter and energy; and that the human world of reason and purpose is unable to dispense with either the vital or the material. The higher world, while formulating its own laws, cannot hope to escape from the laws of the lower worlds from which it has sprung. Man is no doubt a spiritual being, but he is also an animal, and his body is made up of so many chemical ingredients. Man is three systems in one, as the Bensals in Viscount Samuel's *Unknown World* affirm: a chemical system, an electrical system and a psychic system. Dr. Morgan thinks that man has no right to assume that with him alone lies the future. Out of the thousands of millions of species that the earth has known, ninety per cent are now extinct. Man may go the same way, or he may be more lucky and survive—but only if he is more wise than he is at present. Dr. Morgan feels that ethics and morals can provide a way of accelerating evolution; and, if one seriously wills it, one can surmount most difficulties, even the most prosaic of them all, mediocrity. Dr. Morgan gives the term "value" a pragmatic connotation: "Value is experience which those who have it feel that it is better to have than not to have, and anything which contributes to such experience." Science, too, accordingly, comes within the purview of "values." On the question of freedom, Dr. Morgan holds the view that vows of all kinds—including marriage vows—are apt to undermine freedom; and, while he accepts the need for a certain amount of "conditioning the thinking of the people," he wants to avoid the dangers of totalitarian indoctrination or warping of the human mind. With his severely practical mind he deplores theoretical speculations about evil and wants such energies directed to the channels of experimental science dedicated to the conquest of disease and the mastery of the physical environment. He notes that India's backwardness is due to her past preoccupation with introspection and speculative philosophy, even as America's false sense of security is due to her want of "self-

mastery and clarification of purpose." Again the central problem is how to achieve an integral approach to life so that neither is spirit denied nor matter ignored. Beyond saying it must be done, Dr. Morgan can give us no positive clue to conduct.

What, then, is to be the cardinal "purpose" regulating the course of our lives? Dr. Morgan describes it as "loyalty to the adventure of life as a whole," the lesser or more immediate loyalty always being subordinated to the greater "over-all" objective of "the success of mankind in its search for enduring values." No doubt the human adventure may fail, or the success may take a form—say, Big Brother Rule "for ever," as imagined by Orwell in his *Nineteen Eighty-Four*—that might prove to be no more than successful suicide. Dr. Morgan has an open mind: he thinks that if there is no scientific proof to show that the universe is ruled by omnipotent Benevolence, neither have we proof to the contrary, that Malevolence is the cosmic master of the revels. What stretches before us is a vista of infinite possibility, and we need not presume that it all must end in a hideous fiasco. Perhaps there is "purpose" in Nature; perhaps all is blind:—

> Yet seems this vast and singular confection
> Wherein our scenery glints of scantiest size,
> Inutile all—so far as reasonings tell.[1]

Perhaps, again, Its blindness may break at last and "a genial germing purpose" may "fashion all things fair." Whatever the decreed event or likely possibility, Dr. Morgan feels, wholehearted commitment to the adventure of life would fill one's years with creative purpose and make for happiness in personal and community life. He sees in the mastery of the physical world, in education and eugenics, and, above all, in the "enlargement and strengthening of purpose and attitude" the most fruitful means of advancing social improvement and achieving the good life and the ideal society. Nor does he concede that loyalty to the human adventure sanctions utter disregard for other species, even though an exaggerated *ahimsa* may not be feasible or desirable. We are often coerced into numbness by the reckless talk of the next war, which can only be a global atomic war. Dr. Morgan would have us abandon the "atomic alibi" for good. The adventure of evolution is not ended. Man's future has not been prejudiced yet beyond repair. It is still possible with the aid of science and technology and through a refinement of human purpose and initiative to stop the rot in our affairs and open the way to "substantial and continuing human progress."

Such in brief is the argument running through Dr. Morgan's book. Its painstaking veracity and transparent candour are obvious enough. What it lacks is the dissolving fluidity, the enchanting fragrance, of love. Dr. Morgan views all problems with an expert engineer's eye, but in human life there are both constants and variables, and the latter are prone to elude any mere mechanistic calculus. Dr. Morgan's faith in science and technology, and in the processes of reason generally, and his inveterate distrust of religion, metaphysics, mysticism and all forms of esoteric knowledge give his conclusions an apparent clarity, but only at the expense of integral unity and imaginative fullness. Lowell wrote in 1888:—

> Men feel old systems cracking under 'em:
> Life saddens to a mere conundrum
> Which once Religion solved, but she
> Has lost—has science found?—the key.

Dr. Morgan would seem to think that science has indeed found the key. This was a view held in the days of Darwin, Spencer and T. H. Huxley, but one thought that scientists in mid-twentieth century were not quite so sure that reason and science alone could

[1] THOMAS HARDY: *The Dynasts.*

solve our problems and build the earthly paradise we want. If the world of human reason and purpose is an advance on the biological world or the physical world of matter and energy, may we not posit the possibility of an even subtler consciousness emerging from the limited world of reason and purpose with which alone we are now familiar? Ethical, economic and political systems are the concoctions of human reason reacting to the problems of life. How shall we reduce to rational terms the visions and the imaginations of the poet, the agonies and the ecstasies of the god-intoxicated mystic and the ineffable realizations of the saint, the yogi, the *Rishi*? Cannot reason itself be exceeded by other emergent faculties in the new man of the future, cannot the release of these new forces revolutionize earth life as we know it? It is not that Dr. Morgan's conclusions are not valid; they have much to recommend them, and the world would be a happier place if increasing numbers of men and women would regard the adventure of life as earnestly as he has done, pursuing it with a single-minded devotion, but without the taint of egoism or selfishness. Yet more is needed if the human adventure is to succeed in the long run. The dichotomy of matter and spirit that winds across the spaces of human history should give place to a new integral vision that accepts neither the ascetic denial of matter nor the materialist denial of the spirit. From matter to spirit is one single arc of reality, which from our end is essentially a reality of becoming; and it is not through further bombardment of matter or more abundant release of material energy alone that salvation is to be achieved, but also—and more particularly in the present context—through the simultaneous exploration of the reserves of the spirit and the mobilization of spiritual forces. Only then could the crisis in human history be really mastered and our limited, imperfect world transformed into a new heaven and a new earth.

K. R. SRINIVASA IYENGAR

Veda ka Rashtriya Geet (The National Song of the Vedas). By PRIYAVRATA VEDAVACHASPATI. Hindi. (Gurukul Kangdi University, Hardwar. 258 pp. 1955. Rs. 5/-)

The subject-matter of this detailed and descriptive book is well brought out in the synopsis of the blurb. The reader is at once introduced to the treasures of the ancient Vedas. Shri Vedavachaspati's visualization awakens our attention to the glory that was Ind.

The Vedas, no doubt, show us clearly that thousands of years before the Christian era there were individuals who far surpassed twentieth-century intellectuals in their philosophical and spiritual attainments. However, the Vedas must not soothe with a sweet lullaby the mind of the modern Indian, nor must they dazzle and dim other, distant civilizations. Have we mastered the majestic literature of the ancient world to place the Vedas on a pedestal and so nullify their spirituality and universality? It is because of such an attitude that one of the Sages of the Orient exclaimed: "Oh, ye Max Müllers and Monier Williamses, what have ye done with our philosophy!"

J.V.

MADHYAMIKA BUDDHISM*

This is a welcome addition to the growing literature on Buddhism. It is indeed pleasant to note that here is a book born of years of scholarly labour and distinguished by altogether a sympathetic approach, quite unlike some of the popular and "political" books and articles that are appearing in the West these days on the Buddha and Buddhism. The author impresses the reader as a keen student of Sanskrit and as being well equipped to deal with his subject, which is what is sometimes described as Sanskrit Buddhism, in contradistinction to Pali Buddhism. Thus the title of the book seems somewhat misleading (despite the explanation of it in the Preface). The book presents in detail the Madhyamika school, by far the most important milestone in the evolution of later Buddhism. It affords a valuable key to the theoretical foundations on which rest the various schools of Mahayana that have gained currency in China, Japan, Nepal and Tibet.

After a chapter on "The Two Traditions in Indian Philosophy," the author begins the treatise proper by an examination of the concept of *avyakrita* from different angles and finds the spring of dialectic in the Buddha's silences, which he interprets as "the consciousness of the indescribable nature of the Unconditioned Reality." Stating that "to Buddha, then, belongs the honour of having suggested the dialectic first" (which position, however, is on insecure ground), the author points out as the true standpoint of the Madhyamika: "Criticism is deliverance of the human mind from all entanglements and passions." He contends, armed with a whole host of Mahayana texts, that the Madhyamika is the transcendental synthesis (criticism) of the two traditions: the Soul Theory and the No-soul Theory. The history of the Madhyamika school is traced (pp. 87 ff.) from Nagarjuna and Aryadeva (first century B.C.), through Bhavaviveka and Buddhapalita (fifth century), Chandrakirti and Shantideva (seventh and eighth centuries) to Shantarakshita and Kamalashila (eighth century); and in Chapter Four is considered its influence on the two sister schools: Vijnanavada and Yogacara. It is, however, wrong to trace back, as the author does, the evolution of Mahayana to the time of the Buddha's death (p. 77): it was not until 250 B.C., about 300 years after the said event, that the Mahasanghikas emerged as a distinct school, wherefrom Mahayana later developed.

The second part of the book is more interesting, if slightly controversial also. Turning his back on reason, the Madhyamika philosopher resorts to dialectic for resolving the conflict inherent in all intellectual process and eschewing all views and convictions. He naturally lands on the conception of *shunyata*, "the utter negation of thought as revelatory of the real." The death of thought is the birth of Intuition (*Prajna*), which is identical with the Real, the Absolute. Important to all Mahayana schools is the concept of *Prajnaparamita*, the contentless, non-dual, sudden, intellectual intuition, with its practical implication of freedom from ignorance and defilements. An elaborate account of this concept is to be found in Chapter Eight. Now *shunyata* is an extremely vague concept, and it is unfortunate that the author has not shed much clear light on this issue: or is this concept itself subject to dialectic criticism? Chapter Seven, "Application of the Dialectic," is highly interesting. Equally interesting is Chapter Nine, in which the two truths, *Paramartha* (absolute) and *Samvriti* (phenomenal), are explained. Very readable are the author's accounts of the Madhyamika

* *The Central Philosophy of Buddhism: A Study of the Madhyamika System.* By T. R. V. MURTI. (George Allen and Unwin, Ltd., London. xiv+372 pp. 1955. 30*s*)

views on Nirvana, Godhead and the Trikaya theory.

After a scholarly though inadequate comparative estimate of the Madhyamika school alongside some Western dialecticians, Vijnanavada and the Vedanta, the author concludes that "Mahayana absolutism and the Advaita Vedanta are valuable as providing the basis on which a world-culture can be built" (p. 339). This indeed is a strange proposition, thoroughly unrealistic, and the plea that it is "not his province to show how best this could be implemented" (p. 341) does not mitigate the extravagance of the suggestion. When has a culture been built on a philosophical creed? Culture consists of learned behaviour traits, and expresses itself in the way of life a people adopt. The Mahayana or Vedanta absolutism is too intellectual to touch the practical life of any country, let alone the world. The author, moreover, while zealous to present the intellectual aspects of Madhyamika Buddhism, has not told us how it can influence the daily life of a believer. Buddhism is primarily a practical discipline, and mere intellectual excellence therein is no gain.

The student of Theravada Buddhism would wish the author had omitted all reference to Pali scriptures, for too often he is found to present unorthodox and erroneous interpretations: *e.g.*, his account of Arhathood (pp. 263 ff.) and some of his remarks on Nibbana (p. 271).

The chief merit of the book consists in that the author has not relied on translations and other works for his material; he has gone to the originals. And in very few treatises on this subject has such a large collection of valuable material been presented in less than 400 pages; fewer still are books where the author is more sincere. This will doubtless prove an immensely useful book for an advanced research student in Sanskrit Buddhism. It is, however, not intended for the layman.

S. K. Ramachandra Rao

Isopaiambha (Offering to the Lord). By Bahadur Chand Chhabra, "Kavi Chapotkata." (National Publishing House, New Delhi. 31 pp. 1955. Re. 1/-)

The late Rao Bahadur K. N. Dikshit, the Director-General of Archæology in India, used to observe very often that an Indian archæologist ought to be a good Sanskritist, to expect to interpret correctly the valuable finds discovered in Indian excavations. It is a pleasure to find in the Indian Department of Archæology at present many good Sanskritists, like Shri Ramachandran, Dr. B. Ch. Chhabra and others. The Sanskrit poem before us by Dr. Chhabra springs from an "inspirational afflatus," as rightly observed by Dr. C. P. Ramaswami Aiyer. *Isopalambha* contains more than a hundred verses in praise of God Shiva. Apparently they are in censure of the god, but in fact this censure implies praise. This mode of expression was a recognized Sanskrit style called *Ninda-Stuti*, characteristic of some of the best devotional poems in Sanskrit. All lovers of Sanskrit will read with delight this poetical composition of Dr. Chhabra, which shows his mastery over verse technique coupled with felicity of diction and variety of metre. We hope Dr. Chhabra will give us some more poetry in Sanskrit in spite of his professional work of dealing with the dead bones of archæology, which at times is likely to freeze the genial current of Sanskrit poetry in him.

P. K. Gode

Tales of a Grandfather from Assam. By SAHITYA RATHI LAKSHMINATH BEZBAROA. Translated from the Assamese and Illustrated by ARUNA DEVI MUKERJEA. (The Indian Institute of Culture, Bangalore. vii+130 pp. 1955. Rs. 5/12; 8*s.* 9*d.*)

This finely produced volume of Assamese folk tales compels reflection on the essential nature of myths and fairy stories—and the implications of the fact that both nowadays have lost popular appeal in the West.

In the first place, a great fairy tale is not conceived wholly for the delight of children. It has a surface level of enchantment for them, but, essentially, it resembles a palimpsest in that, below the surface, are revelations of an entirely different order. This is, of course, also true of parables. A great fairy tale does not reveal all its secrets to the first comer at the first glance. It contains hidden hints of mysteries—occult truths—glimpses of an ancient forgotten wisdom. Possibly this is why it seems to have lost popular appeal in the West.

The belief that myths are the creations of a people's childish, primitive imagination is not so prevalent as it used to be. In fact, it has been said that a great myth is conceived, and can only be conceived, by the springtime imagination of the culture to which it uniquely relates. (In his remarkable book, *Passion and Society*, Denis de Rougemont not only makes a most convincing case for his contention that Tristan and Iseult is the master-myth of the West, but traces the stages of the myth's degradation from its most mysterious appearance to its ultimate distortion in the twentieth century.)

Swedenborg held that there once existed a long-lost art of writing by "Correspondences"—notable examples being the early chapters of *Genesis* and the book of *Revelation*; although, doubtless, there are many Eastern examples. Incidentally, as this art of "Correspondences" is no longer understood, this may explain the countless contradictory interpretations of ancient "Correspondences" writings. It may be that symbolism is a pallid derivative of this long-lost art. But it seems certain that myths, great fairy tales and parables are intimately related to "Correspondences-writing."

These Assamese folk tales magically create the fabulous timeless world of childhood—that world which, simultaneously, seems remote from our conception of reality, but nearer to an unknown and greater Reality.

"In the golden age of truth, men and beasts spoke the same language."

That is the opening sentence of the amazing tale entitled "The King and the Barber." Not only does this extraordinary statement create no surprise but, to one reader, it suggests a notable "correspondence" with the equally astonishing assertion that—before the erection of the Tower of Babel—"the whole earth was of one language, and of one speech." Also, to read the story of the Barber is to suspect that the triumph of the lame son—who "had all the desired signs on his forehead"—was ensured to some extent by the wealth of his emotional nature, symbolized by his wives, and the unique gift which each wife brought him as dowry.

Space restriction precludes reference to other Tales. Each reader will find his own favourites. Possibly "The Cloth Fit for the Gods" and "The Giant Teacher" would be among them.

The translation, which does not read like one, and the illustrations, which capture the essential quality of the text, are by Aruna Devi Mukerjea.

CLAUDE HOUGHTON

German Literary Influences on the American Transcendentalists. By STANLEY M. VOGEL. (Yale University Press, New Haven; Geoffrey Cumberlege, Oxford University Press, London. xvii+198 pp. 1955. 32*s.*)

According to the author, the American Transcendentalists form a fairly homogeneous group: the writers—Emerson, Alcott, Thoreau; the theologians—Channing, Hedge, Parker and Ripley; the critics—Clarke and Margaret Fuller; the translators—Dwight and Brooks. They all became warm supporters of German literature in the U.S.A. "There can be little doubt that Germany was the ultimate source of the language of Transcendentalism"; they were not only inspired by the works of Goethe, Schiller, Novalis, Jean Paul, Bettina, etc., but also greatly helped by the observations and commentaries of Madame de Staël, Coleridge, Carlyle, etc. Some, like Bronson Alcott, could not read German and naturally depended upon personal advice and translations offered by Margaret Fuller or Emerson and others. But, as the author rightly points out, even Emerson with his Puritan Calvinism was obviously "nettled" by Goethe's "Olympian self-complacency." Goethe's intellectual powers he admired but his "moral delinquencies" he rejected. This attitude does in some way perhaps remind us of Kierkegaard's violent rejection of Goethe the "egotist," and his enthusiastic acceptance of Goethe the poet; *cf.*, "Goethe and Kierkegaard," *Modern Language Quarterly*, September 1949, Seattle, and *"Etudes Germaniques,"* September 1949, by the reviewer.

It was to a large extent Carlyle who coloured Emerson's views on Goethe and Schiller: "... with Goethe gone, Emerson turned to the one person, Thomas Carlyle, who could tell him what he wanted to know about this German." The author, however, cautiously corrects W. S. Vance's wrong notion, in an unpublished dissertation, that the "complete German influence on the Transcendentalists can be traced to the Scotsman." An examination of the Emerson-Carlyle correspondence convinces us that the American Puritan who loved Goethe's *Conversations with Eckermann* accepted no apology for Goethe's "heathen" morals. Under Carlyle's persistent influence Emerson had come to understand Goethe the Christian, although both critics in their last resources preserved their independent judgments of values, even at the height of Emerson's interest in German (about 1835-1840).

The author's study is distinguished by a sober assessment of the given facts. He does not fail to reveal to us the shortcomings of Emerson's attitude to Goethe, whose *Iphigenie auf Tauris* Emerson called an "imitation of the antique," and above all whose *Wahlverwandtschaften* he and most of the Transcendentalists dismissed as a "depraved work of an immoral mind."

Amongst the many other valuable sections in the study special mention should be made of the influence of Kant's distinction between reason and understanding upon the American Transcendentalists. Their main faith was anchored in the belief in moral and intellectual freedom from traditional authority and in the ultimate unity of all things which, as the author says in his concluding sentence, "formed a kinship between the German writers and the New England Transcendentalists. ..."

A. CLOSS

The Empty Room. By VINCENT A. MCCROSSEN. (Philosophical Library, New York. 156 pp. 1955. $2.75)

It has been said that at no period in the history of mankind has man degenerated so much as in this febrile and atomic age. Dr. McCrossen, Professor of Literary Backgrounds of European Civilization at Boston College, discusses the historical background of this deterioration and affirms that the process started in the twelfth, thirteenth and fourteenth centuries in Italy when the Italian banking houses began to set the tempo for so much of modern living. "Anything goes, as long as it is profitable, as long as it makes money" began to be the motto of the day. The English, by their mercantile system, completed what the Italians had begun and became so money-minded that Petrarch, whose outlook on life was notoriously unidealistic, was led to exclaim: "There isn't a one of them who wouldn't sell his soul for a florin." The materialism of Communism, says the author, is only a logical extension of the materialism spawned by the Italian Renaissance and, later, by English greed.

All these factors, gathering momentum through the ages, have made the Room of Meditation at the United Nations an "Empty Room." This Empty Room personified voices the main theme of the book:—

> ...the supposed hope of nations, the United Nations, has reached the term of emptiness and abandonment. They built me—the room for meditation. They, the supposed hope of the world, dared not call upon God, the only Source of hope. For there were members among their united non-unitedness who would be offended by the idea of prayer, by the idea that there is a God. Instead they made me, the empty room, term and goal and symbol of all the emptiness and all the abandonment of empty and abandoning men.
>
> Thus I am empty by all the surrenders and all the compromises of the modern world. Compromises and surrenders which now reach their culmination in me....So the surrenderers end by surrendering God. And that is surrendering everything.

The Empty Room is a courageous and inspiring book which, in spite of a certain tendency to a narrow religious belief, certain findings that may be questioned and a style that is not always adequate to the theme, more than justifies its publication. It serves as a reminder of values needed to extricate the world from the squalor and emptiness which form so large a part of the representative human consciousness of our time.

HILLA C. VAKEEL

Perfect Health: Through Buddhist Mental Science. By B. JAYARAM. (The Maha Bodhi Society of India, Calcutta. 91 pp. 1955. Re. 1/-)

How grateful many will be to Dr. Jayaram for this true guide to health which gives the Buddha's prescription for wholeness (health), moral and bodily, and shows how some of the most modern scientific discoveries of psychosomatic medicine demonstrate the truth of the Buddhist teachings!

It is a new idea in the modern world that selfishness, in one form or another, is the cause of all disease; that the body is in actual fact the child of the mind.

As a Buddhist and an experienced physician, Dr. Jayaram explains that disease germs attack the physical organs

> because the ground is prepared for them by ...vicious thoughts....Such states of thought are far more perilous than infected houses or polluted water.
>
> Medical men are ceasing to believe that a man is despondent or irritable because he has a weak digestion or is dyspeptic and are realizing that he is dyspeptic because he is irritable and despairing.

E.P.T.

The Essenes: Their History and Doctrines. The Kabbalah, its Doctrines, Development and Literature. By CHRISTIAN D. GINSBURG. (Routledge and Kegan Paul, Ltd., London. 245 pp. 1955. 12*s.* 6*d.* *The Essenes* first published, 1864; *The Kabbalah*, 1863, reprinted, 1925)

In the preparation of his essay on the Essenes, Dr. Ginsburg consulted not only the usual classical writers but also the Midrashim and the Talmud.

In Part I he states his conclusions. These are so favourable to the Essenes that lest we should suspect him of bias he gives us, in Part II, translations of the references in Philo, Pliny, Josephus, Solinus, Prophyry, Eusebius and Epiphanius.

Our author then summarizes, in Part III, the researches of scholars up to 1863, when his essay was first published. Little has come to light since then concerning the Essenes, and Ginsburg's is still the best account of that ancient Jewish monastic order.

Part I of his essay on the Kabbalah consists of a most useful summary of many important Kabbalistic doctrines, but the selection is arbitrary.

Our author makes it clear that the Kabbalah is the esoteric part of the Hebrew tradition. As such, its origin is claimed to be necessarily non-human and its entry into this world to be pre-Adamite, and therefore not later than Abraham's encounter with Melkitzedeq. One is, therefore, dismayed to find that in Part II the Kabbalistic doctrines are said to have been "derived from Neo-Platonism" and to date, it seems to be implied, only from the twelfth century A.D.

If Ginsburg was never regularly initiated into a Hebrew esoteric order, his lack of comprehension of certain doctrines would be explained, as would also his lack of familiarity with the way in which documents are treated in such orders. It is only fair to say that the same applies to several of those scholars whose writings on the Kabbalah our author so admirably summarizes in Part III of his essay.

C. A. WINYARD

On Authority and Revelation: The Book on Adler, or a Cycle of Ethico-Religious Essays. By SOREN KIERKEGAARD; translated, with an Introduction and Notes by WALTER LOWRIE. (Princeton University Press, Princeton; Geoffrey Cumberlege, Oxford University Press, London. xxvii+205 pp. 1955. 36*s.*)

This is the latest of the Princeton Books on Kierkegaard, and, like most of the others, it is translated by Dr. Walter Lowrie. Although it is not one of the most important works of Kierkegaard, students will be grateful to Dr. Lowrie and to the Princeton University Press for giving it to them in an English translation. One cannot but admire the meticulous care with which the editor has gone over the text and noted the very numerous changes which the author made in it in the process of revision. If one were to offer a criticism it would be that, whereas Georg Brandes is reported to have said that Kierkegaard had no equal as a writer of Danish prose, the translation is stiff and stilted and difficult to read.

Kierkegaard himself (1813-1855) has come into his own in comparatively recent times. To him we owe the term "Existentialism" and the expression "existential thinking"; and his influence on modern thought, in the fields of both secular speculation and theology, has been very great.

The present work has a long and tangled history, into which we need not enter. Kierkegaard's occasion for writing it was the deposition from the ministry of one Magister Adler, a clergyman of the Danish Church. Adler, a man of about the same age as Kierke-

gaard, had been a convinced Hegelian. He was put in charge of two rural parishes, and is said to have performed his duties with great devotion. While so engaged he claimed to have received a special divine revelation. Jesus Christ not only appeared to him and bade him destroy all his earlier books and papers, but also dictated to him material which he embodied in a book of sermons. The Bishop, convinced that he was of unsound mind, removed him from his office, and he was given a pension. Within the next few years he published various books and pamphlets, including a volume of poems.

Sane or insane, he raised questions which seemed to Kierkegaard to be of first-class importance. In particular there were all the implications of his claim to be the recipient of a special revelation, the grounds for this claim, and the fundamental difference between an inspired man and a genius. But we must content ourselves with indicating what the book is about and leave it to those who are interested to study the argument for themselves.

JOHN MCKENZIE

Fundamental Fundamentals. By ALBERT BRILL. (Philosophical Library, New York. 199 pp. 1955. $3.75)

Fundamental Fundamentals, the publishers suggest, is an attempt to answer the question "What is consciousness?" —a question that has baffled the great thinkers of all time. The forty fundamentals that pervade the Universe and are equally present in man, the microcosm, says Mr. Brill, are Universal Law, Causality, Matter, Energy, Gravitation, Immortality, Time, Space, Number, Awareness, etc. The meaning of these terms is precisely defined in Chapter VI. Next, the fundamentals in operation are interestingly examined. Chapter LIX gathers up the inquiry and poses the still unexplained and apparently inexplicable phenomena.

The author thinks that his attempt is altogether unprecedented in the history of thought. He wonders why no one has counted up the fundamentals though the necessity of fundamentals is admitted by all. Whoever has tried to explain the Universe, from the Greeks till today, he feels, has failed. The reviewer would refer him to the ancient Indian Scripture, the *Bhagavad-Gita*, which accepts (with modifications) the psychology of the Sankhya with its twenty-five fundamentals of Indian cosmology, correlates it with Yoga and develops an all-embracing ethic and philosophy of life.

Mr. Brill's theory of the Universe is coherent and convincing within its limits. But it does not go far enough; there is a central flaw. If the Transcendent is not taken into account, the Universe does not explain itself, nor yet the individual. The Universe points to a Beyond which is its source and sanction as it is of the individual, who is a part of the Universe. Mr. Brill's analysis of the mind in its sixfold manifestation is elementary and repetitive as between the Group Mind and Public Opinion; his Absolute Mind, the Mind of the Universe, is an unimpressive aggregate of individual minds, a sum of relativities, however else characterized.

The presentation throughout is simple and non-technical. The general get-up is unexceptionable. The Contents include an Index which somehow is omitted in the copy for review.

A. VENKAPPA SASTRI

"QUEST"

The well-edited and well-produced bimonthly *Quest* seems, judging from its second issue of October-November 1955, to be also well named. The excellent quality and interest of its contents invite thought; and each contribution in its own way induces the reader to participate in the adventure of seeking.

Both Prabhakar Padhye and G. D. Parikh, authors of a double lead article: "The Intellectual in Modern Asia," give stimulating analyses of the present dilemma of the educated young people of the East. Their hints at solutions induce one to see that no political, social or economic conditions are basic to man. Man himself creates these. It is the quality of the people who make up a country that matters, and real human progress is moral and intellectual; other conditions merely reflect visibly the invisible quality that creates them.

Shri Padhye feels the need of a philosophy; Professor Parikh, the need of a renaissance. Their articles are well worth study. In fact, each essay and book review is quest-inducing. And if "we need to create moral discomfort in India," as stated by Sir Mirza Ismail in his recent article, "A Moral Revolution," the ideas to be found in *Quest* are apparently chosen to contribute to meeting this need.

E.P.T.

DR. RADHAKRISHNAN ON BOOKS

Almost ninety years ago, John Ruskin stated that "a stronger moral state, and a truer thoughtful state," was the "only one pure kind of kingship," which was obtained by "both well-directed moral training and well-chosen reading." Similar thoughts were expressed by the Vice-President, Dr. Radhakrishnan, in regard to the role of books in a democracy on the occasion of presenting State awards for the printing and designing of books at the first competition of its kind held in New Delhi early in November 1955.

According to him, more people would take to reading only if books were made attractive. This could be achieved, to quote Ruskin once again, with

> their text printed all on leaves of equal size, broad of margin, and divided into pleasant volumes, light in the hand, beautiful, and strong, and thorough as examples of binders' work.

Hence, the Vice-President rightly considered the need of improvement in the art of binding a vital one, since "a good book is the precious life blood of a master spirit" to be "embalmed and treasured up on purpose to a life beyond life." How else can this be achieved but by a high standard of the binder's art?

The initiative having been taken now for this encouragement of the arts of printing and binding, a fine field is open for organizations and individuals to develop their talents in these fields and produce books which are both beautiful and enduring.

An example of the sort of printing achievement we must look forward to, even if it takes us years to compass, is the marvellously produced Summer 1955 issue of *Paper & Print* (Stonhill and Gillis, Ltd., London). Much excellent professional advice, and delicate and dignified examples of skill, are to be found in the articles, illustrations and even the advertisements.

Book producing in India, let us hope, will grow into not only a flourishing industry but also an honoured profession.

THE INDIAN INSTITUTE OF CULTURE

[A most interesting paper was read and discussed on the 18th of October under the auspices of the Indian Institute of Culture, Bangalore. The subject was "Heaven and Hell from the Point of View of Psychical Research" and Dr. M. V. Gopalaswami, who occupied the chair, led the discussion.

The writer of the paper, **H. H. Price**, is the Wykeham Professor of Logic at Oxford University. He is the author of numerous books, the latest of which is *Thinking and Experience.*

We print the paper in full; its length necessitates our publishing it in two parts; the second and concluding part will appear next month.—Ed.]

HEAVEN AND HELL FROM THE POINT OF VIEW OF PSYCHICAL RESEARCH

I

It may well be thought that Heaven and Hell are subjects which fall outside the psychical researcher's province altogether. Psychical research may be roughly defined as the scientific investigation of the supernormal or the paranormal. This branch of scientific investigation is a peculiarly complex and baffling one. It has only been in existence for seventy years or so. And it has been pursued hitherto only by a handful of people, mostly in their spare time. Even now, there are not many full-time psychical researchers in the entire world. So it is not surprising that there are many unsettled problems in this field; and, unfortunately, the problem of survival is among them. I do not think it is likely to be solved until we know a good deal more about the paranormal powers of living human beings. Especially we need to know what limits, if any, these paranormal powers have. If we did know what those limits were, we should be able to say, for example, that such and such a veridical mediumistic communication cannot possibly be explained except by postulating a discarnate agency as its source. But at present we are not in this happy position. There is, of course, *evidence* for survival. The evidence is abundant in quantity; and some of it (not all of it!) is good in quality too. But the evidence is not conclusive, at any rate at present. For the psychical researcher, then, survival is a hypothesis rather than a fact. As a religious person, he may, of course, be convinced that human personality does survive death. But, as a psychical researcher, the most he can say at present is that there is evidence for survival, and not that there is proof of it. "Proof" is a very strong word indeed, and should not be used lightly.

Now, if psychical research has not even succeeded in establishing that we survive death at all, how can a psychical researcher have anything to say about such subjects as Heaven and Hell? If he is not yet certain that there *is* any "next world," surely he can have nothing to say about the detailed arrangements which may be supposed to hold in such a world? I do not think this conclusion follows. As I have said, we do have evidence which favours the survival hypothesis. The survival hypothesis is one explanation of a large group of paranormal facts; and for some of them it is much the simplest explanation. We have quite enough evidence, even now, to justify us in taking this hypothesis seriously. If so, one thing the psychical researcher should do is to work at the implications of the idea of survival itself. In particular, he should consider what kind of a world we may be supposed to live in after death, if we do survive death.

Indeed, he needs to consider this question in order to make the survival hypothesis fully intelligible. We cannot attach any clear meaning to the term "survival" until we can form some idea, however rough and provisional, of the kind of experiences which discarnate personalities may be supposed to have.

Thus I think it is not only permissible, but obligatory, for psychical researchers to consider the idea or concept of a "next world" or "after-death world," even though they cannot at present be certain whether there is in fact such a world or not. They are bound to do this if they acknowledge that there is any evidence at all for the survival hypothesis. The survival hypothesis *is* among other things the hypothesis that a next world or after-death world exists.

But though we can properly ask a psychical researcher to tell us what his idea of a "next world" is, I do not think we can expect him to go into great detail about it, at any rate at present. And certainly he cannot be expected to go into great detail on subjects so august and awe-inspiring as Heaven and Hell, though perhaps he might be able to say a little more about the ideas of Paradise and Purgatory. The hypothesis that there is any kind of next world at all is difficult enough to understand, at any rate for Western people educated in the scientific traditions of our present Western civilization. To use a rather inappropriate spatial metaphor, Heaven and Hell are for us very remote parts of the Other World. From our present standpoint, we must be content if we can form some rough idea of its less remote parts, the ones we may be supposed to encounter immediately after death, or shortly after. To put it rather differently: perhaps Heaven and Hell should not be thought of as parts of the *next* world at all, but rather of the next but one. And perhaps our experience and our intellectual and imaginative powers are at present so limited that we cannot hope to say anything intelligible about the next world but one, even though we can perhaps form a provisional and tentative theory about the next. Let us content ourselves, for the present, with this more modest task.

* * *

There are two different ways of conceiving of the next world, and they correspond to two different conceptions of survival itself. First there is what I shall call the "embodied" conception of survival, and secondly there is the "disembodied" conception of it. According to the first, personality cannot possibly exist without a body of *some* kind. At death, a person loses his physical body. So after death he must have a body of some other kind, composed of some "higher" kind of matter, which is not perceptible to our present physical sense organs. It is generally held, by those who accept this conception of survival, that each of us does in fact have such a "higher" body even in this present life, as well as a physical body; that the two bodies may occasionally be separated even in this life, for instance in the "out-of-the-body experiences" of which there are a few examples in the records of psychical research; and that at death this separation becomes permanent.

According to the second or "disembodied" conception of survival, what survives death is not anything material at all. It is just the soul or mind or spirit, and this is regarded as a wholly immaterial entity. Its essential attributes are consciousness or awareness, thought, memory, imagination, desire and the capacity for having emotions. It might, of course, be a complex entity, though an immaterial one; and some of the adherents of this school of thought would distinguish at least two different constituents in it: mind or *psyche* on the one hand and spirit or ego on the other. But we need not trouble ourselves about this point at present. It is sufficient to emphasize that in this conception of survival what survives death is

a wholly immaterial entity. It would, of course, be admitted that in this present life there is the most intimate interaction between the immaterial soul and the material organism, particularly the brain. But at death this interaction ceases, and then the immaterial soul is supposed to exist, and to have experiences, in a completely disembodied state. From one point of view the material organism, with which it interacts in this life, is the instrument of the immaterial soul. By means of this instrument it is able to get information about the material world through the sense organs, and it is also able to control the material world, in some degree, in accordance with its desires. At death the soul is deprived of this useful instrument. But from another point of view, emphasized by the ancient Pythagoreans and Platonists, the material organism may be regarded as the prison of the soul, which prevents it from exercising its full powers and compels it to undergo all sorts of painful and unwelcome experiences. It would be admitted that those experiences may have a disciplinary value, and may even be indispensable for the soul's development. Still, it is better to be out of prison than in it. And from this point of view death is not a loss to the soul, but a gain.

Corresponding to these two different conceptions of survival, there are two different conceptions of the Other World. One may be called the quasi-physical or quasi-material conception of it, the other the psychological conception. Let us begin with the first.

If we accept the "embodied" conception of survival, we are obliged to think of the Other World as a kind of material world, which is the environment of the body the surviving personality is supposed to have. It would be a material world in the sense that it has *spatial* attributes. It might, I suppose, have more than three dimensions and its geometry need not necessarily be Euclidean. But concepts such as "shape," "size," "place" and "motion" would have to apply to it. It would also be necessary, I think, that the objects which make up such a world should have what philosophers call "secondary qualities." The secondary qualities with which we are familiar in this present life are colour, sound, smell, temperature, hardness, softness, etc. We need not suppose that precisely those qualities exist in the Other World. But we should at any rate have to suppose that qualities analogous to them do. It is, I think, inconceivable that any entity should exist which has only spatial attributes (or only spatial and temporal ones) and no other attributes at all. And, finally, we should have to suppose that the objects which make up this Other World—including the objects which are the bodies of surviving personalities—have *causal properties* of some kind, whereby they can cause changes in one another. In this present world we are familiar with many different sorts of causal properties, some more fundamental than others; examples are elasticity, solubility, rigidity, electric charge. We need not suppose that precisely the same causal properties exist in the Other World as well. But we would have to suppose, I think, that the objects which make up the Other World have *some* causal properties, however different these might be from the causal properties which exist in this present world.

According to this conception of it, then, the Other World would still be a material world, however different it might be in detail from the material world with which we are familiar in this present life. And it is of course well known that in many mediumistic communications the Other World *is* described as if it were a material world; and in some of them it appears to be a material world surprisingly similar to this present material world in which we live now. The same could be said of descriptions of the Other World in many religious traditions. Thus in the Christian tradition Paradise is repre-

sented as a garden or park; and this is indeed the literal meaning of the Greek word *paradeisos*.

Now this quasi-material conception of the Other World is faced with an obvious difficulty. If there is such an Other World, *where* is it? This question did not trouble our ancestors very much. Heaven might be up above the bright blue sky, and Hell might be somewhere in the bowels of the earth. Paradise, and Purgatory too, might be located in some unexplored part of the earth's surface. In one of the most splendid passages of ancient classical literature, the sixth book of Virgil's *Æneid*, we are told of Æneas' visit to the Other World, under the guidance of the Sibyl of Cumæ. Apparently they walked there, after first descending into a cavern. At any rate, they walked to the bank of the River Styx, crossed it in Charon's boat, and then continued their journey on foot until they reached the Elysian Fields. Such ideas are no longer credible. Could we get to Heaven in a rocket, or to Hell by tunnelling downwards? The earth's surface has been pretty thoroughly explored by now, and neither Paradise nor Purgatory are to be found on it.

Still, the difficulty is not insuperable. It is true that according to this conception of the Other World, it must be a *spatial* world, as we have seen. But the space of the Other World need not be the physical space with which we are now familiar. The Other World might stand in no spatial relations to this one, even though there were all sorts of spatial relations *within* the Other World, as there are also all sorts of spatial relations within this present world. There is no *a priori* reason why there should not be many different spaces in the universe; many different worlds, each of which is a spatial world, standing in no spatial relations to one another. Indeed, some philosophers have suggested that we are aware of several different spaces even now. Thus it has been thought that there is one space for sight, and a different space for touch.

Alternatively, it might be suggested that there is only one space in the universe, but that it has several more dimensions than the three which our present senses make us aware of; and that after death we shall be aware of other dimensions of space, and cease to be aware of the three which we are aware of now. The idea of a space with more than three dimensions, though strange and baffling to the layman, is perfectly familiar to mathematicians. Supposing it were established that there *is* an Other World, or several other worlds, in addition to the present one, I believe mathematicians would have no great difficulty in suggesting a many-dimensional spatial framework into which all these different worlds could be fitted.

* * *

Let us now turn to the other conception of survival, that I called the "disembodied" conception. It could also be called the Platonic or the Cartesian conception of survival, since both Plato and Descartes thought of the human soul as a wholly immaterial entity. If this conception of survival is accepted, it is not easy to see, at first sight, how there could be "another world" at all. What kind of experiences could a wholly immaterial soul or spirit have? As it has no sense organs of any sort, surely it will have to spend the whole time in pure thought, contemplating the *a priori* truths of logic and mathematics, which are independent of the data of the senses? Such a conception of the after-life will seem to many people exceedingly dreary and unsatisfying, however satisfactory it might be to logicians and mathematicians. Of course, we might have to put up with it, whether it satisfies us or not. What kind of after-life there is, if there is one, is in the end a question of fact, however difficult it may be to answer. If we do exist in a completely disembodied state, and if it is really true that

a completely disembodied spirit or soul can have no experiences except purely intellectual ones, we must just make the best of it, however unsatisfying such an after-life may seem.

But I do not think that the "disembodied" conception of survival does really have these rather unwelcome implications. If we talk about survival at all, we are assuming that personal identity continues after bodily death. And personal identity seems to depend upon memory. If a disembodied soul had no memory whatever of any experience which occurred in earthly life, I do not see what meaning there would be in saying that it was the soul *of* John Smith who used to live in Church Street, Kensington, and worked in the Westminster Bank. We should have to say instead that John Smith's soul ceased to exist when his body died, and that a certain disembodied soul came into existence at that moment, but had nothing particular to do with *him*. We could only call it "his" soul (or "himself in a disembodied state") if it could remember at least some of the experiences which had happened to John Smith in earthly life. Moreover, I think it would also be necessary that the emotional and conative dispositions of this disembodied soul—its "character"—should be more or less similar to the character which John Smith had in earthly life. We should not be surprised if its character gradually altered as a result of *post mortem* experiences, but at any rate there would have to be some continuity between the character a person had before death and the character he has after death, if personal identity is to be preserved.

If this argument is sound, it is not too difficult to form some idea of what the Other World might be like according to the "disembodied" conception of survival. The obvious suggestion is that it would be a kind of dream world; or, to put it the other way round, the dreams we have in this present life would be a kind of foretaste of the experiences we might expect to have after death. In dreams we are cut off from sensory stimuli. The sense organs cease to operate. But this does not at all prevent us from having experiences, sometimes very vivid ones. The perceptible objects we are aware of when awake are replaced by mental images, and these mental images are the product of our own memories and desires. If we retain our memories and desires after death (and there can be no survival at all unless we do, if the argument of the last paragraph is correct), these memories and desires may continue to manifest themselves by means of mental images, as they do in this present life when we are dreaming.

Here it is important to notice that many of our dream images are spatial entities. They have such properties as shape, size and position; at any rate they have position in relation to one another. But, though spatial, they are not in physical space. From the point of view of a waking percipient, perceiving the physical world, dream images are *nowhere*. Perhaps it may be suggested that they are somewhere in the dreamer's head, in some part of his brain, for instance. But I do not think that this suggestion makes sense. Suppose someone dreams of a mountain. The mental image he is aware of has shape and size, and has spatial relations to other dream images which he is aware of at the same time (images of clouds, perhaps, or of other mountains). But is there any meaning in saying that this dream image of his is half an inch high, or two and a half inches to the southwest of his left ear? But, though from the point of view of the physicist or the geographer these images are nowhere, because no position whatever can be assigned to them in a map of the physical universe, they are still spatial entities. The space in which they are, however, is not physical space. They are in a space of their own.

H. H. PRICE

(To be concluded)

ENDS AND SAYINGS

"————————ends of verse
And sayings of philosophers."
HUDIBRAS

Only by contrast with the worse conditions in the Union of South Africa and Kenya can the race relations in the Central African Federation be described as "fairly stable." They were so described by Dr. Clarence E. Glick at the Indian Institute of Culture, Basavangudi, Bangalore, on November 26th. He had recently investigated them on a Ford Foundation Fellowship.

In many parts of Africa the Europeans, there to work or to govern, have a less permanent stake in the country than where European settlers look upon Africa as their home. There are such settlers in Kenya and the South African Union, as well as in the Central African Federation, but the European element in the latter was described as somewhat differently constituted. It included not only settlers of long standing who had come from South Africa but later arrivals from there, disgusted with Nationalist policies and apprehensive of their probable effects. There was also the leaven of recent British immigrants with a liberal Labour Party outlook and some Scandinavians, open-minded towards racial questions.

Exploitation of the Africans by the politically and economically dominant minority there undoubtedly is. Europeans have acquired much of the best land. There is urbanization of ill-paid labour, living under conditions conducive to vice and disease, and there have resulted a weakening of family and tribal relations and other evils characteristic of colonization at its worst. Africans were, however, Dr. Glick explained, represented in the Federal Assembly and were becoming more grievance-conscious and power-conscious and more vocal. Change was recognized as inevitable, though its pace might be only sufficient to keep ahead of African demands. The wealth of natural resources might encourage sharing.

The dullest mind not blinded by self-interest must recognize the evils of exploitation and discrimination in such an aggravated form as colonialism at its worst presents. But their lessons will be missed if they are taken by the rest of the world only as proof of the special depravity of those who acquiesce in them. They have their roots in human nature made vile by selfishness; and indignation ought to turn the searchlight inward. But for all that the voice of Democracy must rise to wipe out this political barbarism of an age which is dead.

Shri M. Patanjali Sastri makes many points and thoughtful suggestions in *The Vedanta Kesari*, November 1955, towards "The Orientation Hinduism Requires." In the attempt to secure liberty and justice and prosperity for all men, a new social pattern is arising in India which is in danger of sacrificing "the people's traditional scheme of moral and spiritual values" for industrial growth. The secularity of the State, Shri Sastri reminds us, implies, not discouragement of Religion, not a belief that "economic welfare" is enough, but only neutrality between forms of religion. This leaves with the followers of the Hindu religion the burden of educating the people in its moral and spiritual values.

The resources of the Devasthanams (endowed temples) and Mathams (monasteries), etc., suggests Shri Sastri, would be more rightly used in such education than diverted to secular schools. This new effort must be

not for proselytizing, for that is foreign to the spirit and tradition of our religion, but for refuting and repelling these onslaughts by spreading knowledge of the fundamentals of that religion.

Spreading "knowledge of the fundamentals of that religion" would do more than repel onslaughts: it would purify the practices of Hinduism from within. Shri Sastri lays admirable stress on the fact that Hinduism enjoins tolerance and recognizes the efficacy of various forms of worship. *The* scripture for our time, therefore, he shows, is the *Bhagavad-Gita,* for

that gospel is not based on dogmatic theologies and does not require its followers to abandon the life of this world, but prescribes only detachment from the fruits of action.

Without religious education, Shri Sastri insists, our young people cannot grow up full men and women; but it must be forced on none, and it must aim at creating an atmosphere where the pupils sense the Divine Presence rather than at inculcating dogma.

Shri Sastri's essay is lucid and wise; its special merit is that the reflections in it could, *mutatis mutandis*, be applied with benefit to other forms of religion than Hinduism.

Recently Shri B. G. Kher, President of the National Committee for the Prevention of Alcoholism, India, told a press conference that Prohibition would never succeed until public opinion supported it, that legislation alone could never eliminate social evils. Therefore the National Committee was sponsoring the Institute of Scientific Studies for the Prevention of Alcoholism, which would do research as well as provide scientific training, facts and information in all phases of the alcohol problem.

Shri Kher explained that "a nation-wide educational programme for the prevention of alcoholism" was being planned; and a course would be given comprising "lectures, seminars, discussions and field trips," to provide intelligent and effective workers for the cause of "national sobriety."

It is to be hoped that the Institute will not overlook that the average man needs not only knowledge of and warning against the evils of drinking but also "healthy and interesting occupation" for his leisure hours. This idea is being used effectively in the West in the treatment of alcoholics, especially the young. The work of the Temperance Friendly Societies and the International Temperance Movement should be a help in making the plans for this work in India.

In *Science and Culture* (November 1955), Professor H. L. Chakravarty, botanist of Presidency College, Calcutta, offers a list of food plants which he suggests might be advantageously introduced into India.

One of the defects in the Hindu vegetarian menus is a lack of judicious use of vegetables. Conservatism and lack of variety are responsible for this. The suggestion made in this short but practical article is worth prompt attention.

Dr. Doris Lorden Glick's subject at the Indian Institute of Culture, Basavangudi, Bangalore, on November 28th was "The Roles of Government and Private Activity in Social Welfare in a Democratic Society." She was convinced of the importance of the social welfare efforts both of the Government and of organizations privately initiated and controlled.

We by no means undervalue wise and well-considered legislative or charitable measures to protect the weak against exploitation and to ameliorate the condition of the poor, as supplements to personal sympathy and help. But we do maintain that each country has its own problems and has worked out certain solutions, valid as far as

they go. Fear of being deemed old-fashioned or of seeming to lag behind Western countries in zeal for the relief of distress does not justify the scrapping of indigenous social patterns of proved value instead of merely supplementing them as may be necessary. To abandon them because they do not cover the whole field would seem to be repeating in the social sphere the mistake of many Indians in the last century who accepted their country's culture at others' valuation and imitated cultural expressions unsuited to their genius.

Dr. Glick mentioned among private social welfare activities in the U.S.A. marriage counselling and youth counselling, both important in that country of high divorce and juvenile delinquency rates. They are less so for India.

Dr. Glick expressed considerable interest in the contribution to social security made by the Indian joint family. It assured its aged people a recognized status in the home and the strong mutual tie among its members insured assistance to a brother in economic difficulties. She reported a partial application of the joint-family idea as surviving in rural America, where it was the custom for the old people to remain in their farmhouse and for a son and his family to move in with them when they could no longer carry on alone. But when a family moved to the city, where the houses were small, it often appeared impracticable to take the old people along. She questioned the future of the Indian joint family as urbanization progressed.

But are not its benefits worth conserving? Could their loss be compensated by stereotyped social-security legislation such as unemployment insurance and old-age pensions, often providing too little and providing it too late? Ask the poor relations and the unwanted old in Western lands whether "a dinner of herbs where love is" would not be their choice!

A much needed reform is brought to public attention in a brochure compiled and published by Shri C. Tejpal of Rajkot. *Funeral Reforms* makes an earnest, convincing and urgent appeal to the Indian Government to legislate for the proper disposal of dead bodies for the sake of the living.

In many cities old burial grounds, still being used, are now surrounded by residences and offices, making them dangerous disseminators of both physical and psychic diseases. These should be abolished. Another aspect of the protest is against men carrying corpses to the places of disposal. Shri Tejpal states that both the *Atharva Veda* and Gandhiji advocate more dignified and hygienic means. The former lays down that the bier should be taken to the outskirts of a town on a vehicle; the latter recommends a hearse for conveying the corpse and cremation for its disposal.

The Rajkot Social Service League has built a crematorium for the free use of all. It is to be hoped that other philanthropic groups will follow its example.

We regret we introduced wrongly Mr. R. D. F. Pring-Mill, writer of "Spanish Mystics", in our November and December issues. He is Lecturer in Spanish in the University of Oxford, and late Senior Demy of Magdalen College.